

PLANNING COMMISSION AGENDA

CHAIRPERSON:

Adam Peck



VICE CHAIRPERSON:

Mary Beatie

COMMISSIONERS: Marvin Hansen, Chris Tavarez, Bill Davis, Mary Beatie, Adam Peck

MONDAY, MARCH 11, 2024
VISALIA COUNCIL CHAMBERS
LOCATED AT 707 W. ACEQUIA AVENUE, VISALIA, CA
MEETING TIME: 7:00 PM

1. CALL TO ORDER –
2. THE PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE –
3. CITIZEN'S COMMENTS – This is the time for citizens to comment on subject matters that are not on the agenda but are within the jurisdiction of the Visalia Planning Commission. You may provide comments to the Planning Commission at this time, but the Planning Commission may only legally discuss those items already on tonight's agenda.

The Commission requests that a five (5) minute time limit be observed for Citizen Comments. You will be notified when your five minutes have expired.
4. CHANGES OR COMMENTS TO THE AGENDA –
5. CONSENT CALENDAR - All items under the consent calendar are to be considered routine and will be enacted by one motion. For any discussion of an item on the consent calendar, it will be removed at the request of the Commission and made a part of the regular agenda.
 - No items on the Consent Calendar

6. WORK SESSION DISCUSSION – Brandon Smith, Principal Planner & Devon Jones, Economic Development Manager

Initiation of Potential Zoning Text Amendments: Provide staff direction toward initiating various text amendments within Visalia Municipal Code Title 17 (Zoning Ordinance) based on multiple factors including, but not limited to:

- Changes in state law
- Errors in existing zoning text
- Changes in other sections of the Visalia Municipal Code or changes in city procedures
- Changes in business and/or development trends and activity

No action pertaining to the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) is required since the item is a work session item with no actions being requested at this time.

7. CITY PLANNER/ PLANNING COMMISSION DISCUSSION –

- a. Presentation of the 2023 Housing Element Annual Progress Report (APR) and Program Reporting
- b. March 6, 2024 LAFCO Hearing – Belissa Annexation & Linwood County Island
- c. Planning Commission Updates

The Planning Commission meeting may end no later than 11:00 P.M. Any unfinished business may be continued to a future date and time to be determined by the Commission at this meeting. The Planning Commission routinely visits the project sites listed on the agenda.

For Hearing Impaired – Call (559) 713-4900 (TTY) 48-hours in advance of the scheduled meeting time to request signing services.

Any written materials relating to an item on this agenda submitted to the Planning Commission after distribution of the agenda packet are available for public inspection in the City Office, 315 E. Acequia Visalia, CA 93291, during normal business hours.

APPEAL PROCEDURE

THE LAST DAY TO FILE AN APPEAL IS THURSDAY, MARCH 21, 2024, BEFORE 5:00 PM

According to the City of Visalia Zoning Ordinance Section 17.02.145 and Subdivision Ordinance Section 16.04.040, an appeal to the City Council may be submitted within ten days following the date of a decision by the Planning Commission. An appeal form with applicable fees shall be filed with the City Clerk at 220 N. Santa Fe, Visalia, CA 93291. The appeal shall specify errors or abuses of discretion by the Planning Commission, or decisions not supported by the evidence in the record. The appeal form can be found on the city's website www.visalia.city or from the City Clerk.

THE NEXT REGULAR MEETING WILL BE HELD ON MONDAY, MARCH 25, 2024



REPORT TO CITY OF VISALIA PLANNING COMMISSION

HEARING DATE: March 11, 2024

PROJECT PLANNER: Brandon Smith, Principal Planner
Phone: 559-713-4636
Email: brandon.smith@visalia.city
Devon Jones, Economic Development Manager
Phone: (559) 713-4190
E-mail: devon.jones@visalia.city

SUBJECT: Work Session Discussion - Initiation of Potential Zoning Text Amendments:
Provide staff direction toward initiating various text amendments within Visalia Municipal Code Title 17 (Zoning Ordinance) based on multiple factors including, but not limited to:

- Changes in state law
- Errors in existing zoning text
- Changes in other sections of the Visalia Municipal Code or changes in city procedures
- Changes in business and/or development trends and activity

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends that the Planning Commission receive this staff report, presentation, and provide input on initiating various potential zoning text amendments.

Additionally, staff recommends initiating the text amendments listed in '**Section 1**'. Staff will return with draft amendment language and a formal Zoning Text Amendment item for Planning Commission and City Council consideration.

Staff will also return at a future date with additional information, based on input received from the Planning Commission, regarding potential amendments listed in '**Section 2**'.

RECOMMENDED MOTION

I move to authorize staff to initiate zoning text amendments as discussed in '**Section 1**'.

Alternative: I move for staff to come back at a future Planning Commission meeting with additional information as requested.

POTENTIAL ZONING TEXT AMENDMENTS

The text amendments discussed herein are being requested by City staff to update the Zoning Ordinance and to respond to current issues. It has been staff's practice every few years to process City-initiated text amendments for reasons that generally include clean-up and adjustment. There has not been a comprehensive Zoning Ordinance Amendment request since 2017, when the City Council adopted the Zoning Ordinance Update in follow-up to the General Plan Update.

Staff has divided these potential amendments into two separate sections. Section 1 consists of mainly non-substantive or 'clean-up' amendments that have been identified over time to 'correct' existing language. Section 2 consists of more complex amendments that staff believes warrants Planning Commission review and consideration as they may better reflect actual development or

industry activity, changes in development and business trends, changes in state law, or streamline the zoning text. Pending Commission authority to initiate zoning text amendments for Section 1, staff will return at a future Planning Commission meeting with formal ZTA language updates for Commission's recommendation to be sent to Council for adoption. For Section 2 amendments, staff recommends returning to Planning Commission and possibly City Council for further discussion before proceeding with a formal request to process a ZTA to address these items.

Below is a list of the Section 1 and 2 amendments for Planning Commission consideration. As part of this work session dialogue, staff will consider any other potential amendment suggestions and feedback from the Planning Commission.

Section 1

CHAPTER 17.12 SINGLE-FAMILY RESIDENTIAL ZONE

Section 17.12.100 Rear Yard

C. Main structures may encroach up to five feet into a required rear yard area provided that such encroachment does not exceed one story and that a usable, open, rear yard area of at least one thousand ~~two hundred and fifty~~ five hundred (1,250~~1,500~~) square feet shall be maintained. ~~Such encroachment and rear yard area shall be approved by the city planner prior to issuing building permits.~~

Summary: The 1,500 square feet requirement was a requirement dating to when the Single-family Residential zone had a minimum lot size of 6,000 square feet (i.e., R-1-6 zone). The reduced usable rear yard area carries over the same ratio of yard area into the R-1-5 zone. Also, these approvals have historically been conducted by staff without input from the City Planner.

CHAPTER 17.12 SINGLE-FAMILY RESIDENTIAL ZONE

Sections 17.12.040 Conditional Uses

C. Public and private charitable institutions, general hospitals, sanitariums, nursing and convalescent homes, and hospices; not including specialized hospitals, sanitariums, or nursing, rest and convalescent homes including care for acute psychiatric, drug addiction or alcoholism cases;

CHAPTER 17.16 MULTI-FAMILY RESIDENTIAL ZONE

Sections 17.16.040 Conditional Uses

B. Public and private charitable institutions; general hospitals, sanitariums, nursing and convalescent homes, and hospices; including specialized hospitals, sanitariums, or nursing, rest and convalescent homes including care for acute psychiatric, drug addiction or alcoholism cases;

Summary: Hospices are a use that is similar to others in the category.

CHAPTER 17.18 COMMERCIAL ZONES

Sections 17.18.060, 070, and 080 Development standards in the C-N, C-R, and C-S zone

17.18.060 D. Minimum required landscaped yard (setback) areas:

2. Rear: five (5) feet (except where a building is located on rear side property line);

17.18.070 D. Minimum required landscaped yard (setback) areas:

2. Rear: five (5) feet (except where a building is located on rear property line);

17.18.080 D. Minimum required landscaped yard (setback) areas:

2. Rear: five (5) feet (except where a building is located on rear side property line);

Summary: Incorrect location listed; Rear setback should be matched with rear setback. Additionally, the C-R zone language omits this phrase entirely so it should be added.

CHAPTER 17.19 MIXED USE ZONES

Sections 17.19.070 Development standards in the D-MU zone and in the C-MU zones inside the downtown area

17.19.070 D. Minimum required landscaped yard (setback) areas:

6. Street side on corner lot: five (5) feet (except where a building is located on property line).

Summary: Need to insert “except where a building is located on property line” to clarify, since this zone does permit buildings on property line.

CHAPTER 17.28 SITE PLAN REVIEW PERMIT

17.28.100 Lapse of site plan review permit.

A site plan review permit shall lapse and become null and void one year following the date of approval unless, prior to the expiration of one year, a planning entitlement is approved by the Planning Commission or City Council, or a building permit is issued by the building official and construction is commenced and diligently pursued toward completion.

Summary: Clarify that a Planning entitlement will allow for a site plan review permit to continue to be active beyond one year.

CHAPTER 17.28 regarding SITE PLAN REVIEW COMMITTEE

Summary: The term ‘Site Plan Review Committee’ should be discontinued and will be updated to ‘Site Plan Review staff’, since this body does not serve as a committee with members of the public (like other Committees and Commissions), but of City and Responsible Agency staff. This requires edits to chapters both inside and outside of Title 17.

In addition, other edits regarding site plan review processes and procedures are necessary to reflect current processes such as electronic submittals vs. paper submittals and online meetings.

CHAPTER 17.32 SPECIAL PROVISIONS

17.32.140 Garage Conversions.

B. Requirements:

1. The site is being used as a single-family, detached, residence with a minimum lot size of five thousand (5,000) square feet;

~~2. The area converted shall be used as part of the main dwelling and shall not be used as a separate dwelling unit or accessory dwelling unit;~~

~~23.~~ The area converted shall be subject to all applicable building code requirements;

~~4. The site shall be owner occupied and that such ownership shall have been in effect for a minimum of twelve (12) months prior to approval of a conversion under this section;~~

~~35.~~ The garage door shall either be removed from the structure, or a wall shall be constructed behind the preexisting garage door with the garage door remaining in place. The exterior elevation of the conversion shall be compatible in design with the existing dwelling;

~~46.~~ In the case of garage door removal buffering, such as a planter, shall be provided between the carport or garage and the remaining parking area;

~~57.~~ The remaining parking area shall have two parking spaces, each space having a minimum width of nine (9) feet and a minimum depth of eighteen (18) feet from the property line.

Summary: Remove 12 month occupancy rule and owner occupancy requirement due to the City's inability to review and enforce this requirement. Additionally, State law now permits ADUs within garages.

CHAPTER 17.34 OFF-STREET PARKING AND LOADING FACILITIES

17.34.020 Schedule of off-street parking space requirements.

A. ~~65.~~ Planned unit developments, condominiums: one covered parking space plus one uncovered guest parking space for each dwelling unit.

Summary: Numbering correction; Should be item #6 since #5 is repeated twice.

CHAPTER 17.36 FENCES, WALLS AND HEDGES

Section 17.36.040 Multiple-family residential zones

A. Fences, walls and hedges not exceeding seven feet in height shall be permitted except that in a required front yard, or within five feet of a street side property line a ~~required side yard~~ on a corner or side on cul-de-sac lot, a fence, wall or hedge shall not exceed three feet in height. A fence or wall may be allowed to a height of four feet provided that the additional one-foot height is at least fifty (50) percent open.

Section 17.36.050 Commercial and mixed use zones

D. No fence or wall shall exceed seven feet in height if located in a required side or rear yard or three feet in height if located in a required front yard or street side yard. A fence or wall may be allowed in a required front yard or street side yard to a height of four feet provided that the additional one-foot height is not of a solid material, ~~upon approval of the city planner.~~

Section 17.36.060 Office zones (O-PA, O-C, BRP)

B. No fence or wall in the OPA, O-C, or BRP zone shall exceed seven feet in height if located in a required side or rear yard or three feet in height if located in a required front yard or street side yard. A fence or wall may be allowed in a required front yard or street

side yard to a height of four feet provided that the additional one-foot height is not of a solid material, ~~upon approval of the city planner.~~

Section 17.36.070 Industrial zones.

D. No fence or wall shall exceed seven feet in height if located in a required side or rear yard or three feet in height if located in a required front yard or street side yard. A fence or wall may be allowed in a required front yard or street side yard to a height of four feet; provided, that the additional one-foot height is not of a solid material.

Summary: All sections need to be edited to be consistent with the fence standards for Single-family residential zones, which describe allowing a three-foot fence within a required front yard *or within five feet of a street side property line on a corner lot*. Section 17.36.040 is revised to have consistent wording as other sections. Also, these approvals have historically been conducted by staff without input from the City Planner.

CHAPTER 17.48 SIGNS

Summary: Various clean-up edits to the Sign Ordinance, summarized as follows:

17.48.030 Exempt Signs.

- 17.48.030.C – ‘Commercial Displays on Vehicles’ section 1 should be removed as this is unenforceable and unrealistic, leaving section 2 only.
- 17.48.030.G – ‘Interior Signs’ section needs to be rewritten to address signage in spaces such as Visalia Mall that require permitting due to electrical work associated.
- 17.48.030.L – Refers to Section 17.48.110(I) when it should refer to Section 17.48.110.F.

17.48.040 Prohibited Signs.

- 17.48.040.N – ‘Snipe Signs’ section needs to be revised to allow individuals to post such signs on their own property (e.g., ‘beware of dog’ signs on fences, in yards).

17.48.090 Sign Standards for Agricultural and Residential Zones.

- 17.48.090.D.1 – In ‘Temporary Signs Allowed on Residential Properties’ the code references to temporary window sign and temporary banners are reversed.
- 17.48.090.E.2.c – In ‘Temporary Signs on Developing Residential Properties’ the code reference to temporary banners incorrectly references code for temporary window signs.
- 17.48.090.G – In ‘Public and Quasi-Public Uses’ the maximum sign areas specified in subsection G.2 and in the figure are in conflict.

17.48.100 Sign Standards for Other Zones.

- 17.48.100 - This section should be renamed “Sign Standards for Commercial, Office, Industrial, and Quasi-Public Zones”.

17.48.110 Standards for Specific Sign Types.

- 17.48.110.C.6 – ‘Sign Base’ section needs to remove “of 10 feet or less”.
- Figure 17.48.110(C) caption shall remove the phrase “for signs 10 ft. or less in height”.

- 17.48.110.C.8 - This section is not needed; it is redundant of Sections 17.48.110.C.4 and 5.
- 17.48.110.D.3 – The maximum height specified is in conflict with that indicated in figure 17.48.110(D)
- 17.48.110.E.3 - Remove phrase “per sign”.

17.48.160 Nonconforming Signs.

- 17.48.160.C. – Add specific language for noticing property owners.

CHAPTER 17.58 DOWNTOWN RETAIL OVERLAY DISTRICT

17.58.050 Procedures for review of applications

~~E. It shall be the duty of the site plan review committee to review all applications for sign permits within the district. Applications for sign permits shall be obtained from and filed with city pursuant to Chapter 17.48, and thereafter the application shall immediately be referred to the site plan review committee for their review and recommendation. The site plan review committee may recommend approval, conditional approval or denial of the sign permit application. The application shall then be presented to the proper issuing authority for sign permits, pursuant to Chapter 17.48 of the Municipal Code. Sign permits shall be issued only in compliance with the recommendation of the site plan review committee. Approval by the site plan review committee in no way implies approval by the issuing authority for sign permits, whose approval must also be secured pursuant to Chapter 17.48.~~

Summary: Remove requirement for Site Plan Review consideration of any signage within the Downtown Retail Overlay District. This is currently not enforced and is not consistent with the purpose of Site Plan Review.

CHAPTER 17.25 USES IN THE COMMERCIAL, MIXED USE, OFFICE, AND INDUSTRIAL ZONES

17.25.030 Commercial, Office, and Industrial Zone Use Table.

Summary: Various non-substantive edits to the Zone Use Matrix, including clean-up, removing of unutilized lines, capitalization, addition of notes, and addition of clarification. No changes are being recommended in Section 1 regarding the allowance of the use in a specific zone (i.e. permitted, conditionally allowed, not allowed). Section 2 however will entail changing the allowance of uses in specific zones. Specific changes for Section 1 are as follows:

- There are two Line M17s, the latter to be renumbered along with the resulting renumbering required.
- Removing line items that do not have listed permitted, or conditionally permitted zones given listing them could cause confusion that those uses could be permitted in various zones.
- Capitalizing listed uses that may be a single use and not part of a list for consistency and ease of use for viewers.
- Adding a capitalized Drive Thru list header.

- Revise 'Parking Facilities for Off-site uses' (P2) to make consistent with Section 17.34.060 by adding reference in 'Special Use Standards' column.
- Add 'Quick Service' to 'Fast Food Restaurants' (E6 and E7)
- Revise 'Combined office/warehouse' (M45) to add 25% office space restriction.
- Removal of several line items that are duplicative or otherwise unnecessary, specifically:
 - Clothing Costume Rental (C6) - Addressed in Retail
 - Adult Daycare, 7 to 12 (D2) - Redundant, edit D1
 - Children Daycare, 9 to 14 (D5) - Redundant, edit D4
 - Pizza Sandwich Shops with/without alcohol, Ice cream shop (E8 – E10) -Addressed in Fast Food
 - Night Clubs/Discotheques (E11) – Addressed in Live Entertainment (E12)
 - Lumberyard (see also Retail) (M6) - Addressed in Retail
 - Hospices (M58) – Add 'hospices' to 'Convalescent Hospitals/Senior Care Facilities/Nursing Homes' (M55)
 - Opticians – Dispensing (M61) – Addressed in Medical Offices
 - Temporary Trailers (O10) - No longer processed with TCUPs
 - Private Libraries (R6)
 - Temporary Facilities (Christmas tree recycling) (R25)
 - Household Pets (R32)
 - Add 'Lumberyard' to Fencing Stores/yards (R43)
 - Floor & Wall Coverings, Hardware Stores, Paint Stores (R44, R48 - R51) combine under 'Home Improvement' (R52) to be permitted in all C zones
 - Outlet stores (R70 - R72) - Addressed in Retail
 - Printing Services (S27) - Addressed in Manufacturing (M35), Photocopying (P4), Photography (P6)

Section 2

The following are several potential considerations based on actual development activity, changes in state law, changes in business terminology, opportunities for efficiency, or creation of operating standards in lieu of entitlement requirements.

- Table 17.25.030 – Commercial, Office, and Industrial Zone Use Table:
 - Add line item for 'Event centers, banquet halls, and/or event venues'.
 - Add line item for other types of recreational uses to reduce CUPs for 'Other Recreational Facilities' (R18). Examples: Escape Rooms, VR Arcades, etc.
 - Expand line item for 'Clinics' (M57) into more specific line items to better segregate for potentially permitted by right uses, and/or define 'Clinic' in 17.04.
 - Expand line item for 'Medical Offices' (O6) into more specific line items to better segregate for potentially permitted by right uses, and/or define in 17.04.
 - Re-evaluate 'Barbers, Hairstylists, Day Spas, etc.' (B3) requirement of CUP in Office zones (O-PA, O-C)
 - If 'Day Spa' is the use more specific to requiring a CUP, then separate out the use types.

- Re-evaluate 'Tattooist' (B5) requirement of a CUP in C-MU zone.
 - Re-evaluate 'Tutoring Center' (S8) requirement of a CUP in all zones.
 - Define the source of concern. (e.g., # of students/size, traffic impacts)
 - Re-evaluate 'Counseling Offices' (O7 and O8) requirement of a CUP in zones.
 - Re-evaluate Industrial zone allowed uses, based upon the General Plan / Zoning Ordinance Update re-designating large areas from Light Industrial to Industrial.
 - Example: allow 'Air Conditioning Shops' (S9) in I zone as a type of contractor yard.
 - Eliminate 'Water Processing & Bottling Plants' (M30) from the table given groundwater resource concerns; separate 'Soft Drink Bottling & Distribution' (M28) into separate categories for 'bottling' as a conditionally allowed use in the I zone and 'distribution' as a permitted use in both zones.
 - Add line item for 'Social Media Studio' in office type zones
 - Define & add line item for 'Battery storage facilities' under the Utilities section
 - Add temporary uses (TCUPs) to the matrix including:
 - Food Cart Food Trucks (Issued for six months. Cannot locate at same location after six months)
 - Cell Phone Give-away tents
 - Events which block off parking spaces and/or access on private property (subject to impact on parking or adjacent businesses):
 - Parking lot sales
 - Seasonal storage
 - Fundraising events
 - Car shows
 - Warming Centers/Cooling Centers
 - Flower sales (Valentine's Day, Mother's Day, etc.). Only allowed for vendors selling outside of their established business.
 - Live entertainment (Issued for venues hosting a one-day event with paid or limited entry. E.g. Adventure Park)
 - Add line item for 'Reversion to Residential Use" as permitted in Office zones and any other zones where residences are established in non-residential zones.
 - Add definitions to Chapter 17.04 to further clarify various proposed uses listed.
- Chapter 17.16: Multi-family Residential Zones
 - Reevaluate rear yard setback requirements for smaller multifamily developments.
 - Chapter 17.24: Business Research Park Zone
 - Consider adding new permitted and/or conditional uses such as medical offices.
 - Section 17.30.015: Development standards
 - Consider adding section for lighting impacts/standards to more accurately quantify potential light pollution to adjacent sensitive uses using current industry standards
 - Section 17.32.162: Drive-thru lane performance standards
 - Reevaluate drive-thru performance standards, which could include (among others):
 - Prohibiting drive-thrus if w/in 250' of residential

- Potentially removing 17.32.162 B.6. (Drive thru menu board orientation requirement)
 - Specifying when a queuing analysis is required
- Chapter 17.34: Off-Street Parking and Loading Facilities:
 - Update parking standards based upon new state laws:
 - Multi-family residential requirements = 1 stall for affordable studio / 1-bed units
 - Properties along a High transit corridor exempted from parking
 - Dance, martial arts, gyms, yoga studios: re-evaluate parking standards
- Chapter 17.36: Fences, Walls, and Hedges
 - Clarify wording regarding use of barbed wire.
 - Fencing materials allowed needs to be defined.
- Section 17.38.070: Temporary Conditional Use Permits (TCUPs)
 - Reevaluate TCUP processes and standards.
- Section 17.48.140: Master Sign Program
 - Add clarifying language as to what qualifies as a 'minor variance' allowed under the MSP.

BACKGROUND INFORMATION

Environmental Review:

The requested action would be considered exempt under Section 15061(b)(3), Per Section 15061(b)(3) of the State Guidelines for the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA). A Notice of Exemption has been prepared for the project because Section 15061 (b) (3) states that the project is exempted from CEQA if the activity is covered by the commonsense exemption that CEQA applies only to projects that have the potential for causing a significant effect on the environment. Where it can be seen with certainty that there is no possibility that the activity in question may have a significant effect on the environment, the activity is not subject to CEQA.

City of Visalia



To: Planning Commission

From: Brandon Smith, Principal Planner
Paul Bernal, Director/City Planner

Date: March 11, 2024

Re: 2023 Housing Element Annual Progress Report (APR) and Program Reporting

Summary

Pursuant to State Housing Law (Government Code Section §65400), cities and counties are required to report their progress on implementing their current Housing Elements. The report includes a summary of the jurisdiction's housing activity, progress in reaching their Regional Housing Needs Assessment (RHNA) by income level, and progress in implementing our Housing Element's goals and programs.

The report is a useful tool for City officials, staff, citizens, and stakeholder groups interested in the City's housing trends, particularly as they relate to affordable housing. The report must be reviewed by the City Council, submitted to HCD by April 1st, and accepted by HCD. Failure to prepare and deliver the report on a timely basis incurs risk of the City losing future housing grant funding opportunities.

The report demonstrates that the City follows all applicable State laws and policies pertaining to housing, and that the City is implementing its housing policies and programs as articulated in its midcycle or four-year update to the 5th Cycle Housing Element adopted in December 2019. (The City will begin reporting on its progress on the 6th Cycle Housing Element, which was completed in December 2023, starting next year.)

Background Discussion

Pursuant to State Housing Law (Government Code Section §65400), cities and counties are required to report their progress on implementing their current Housing Elements. The report includes a summary of the jurisdiction's housing activity, progress in reaching their Regional Housing Needs Assessment (RHNA) by income level, and progress in implementing our Housing Element's goals and programs.

The report is a useful tool for City officials, staff, citizens, and stakeholder groups interested in the City's housing trends, particularly as they relate to affordable housing. The report must be reviewed by the City Council, submitted to HCD by April 1st, and accepted by HCD. Failure to prepare and deliver the report on a timely basis incurs risk of the City losing future housing grant funding opportunities.

The report demonstrates that the City follows all applicable State laws and policies pertaining to housing, and that the City is implementing its housing policies and programs as articulated in its midcycle or four-year update to the 5th Cycle Housing Element adopted in December 2019. (The City will begin reporting on its progress on the 6th Cycle Housing Element, which was completed in December 2023, starting next year.)

The 2023 APR forms and tables are largely unchanged from the previous year’s format. The APR continues to require listing and affordability determination of all “considered” housing projects (i.e., potential projects submitted to the Site Plan Review Committee), completed entitlements, and individual building permits for every individual housing unit. Jurisdictions report these units to gain credit against their RHNA housing unit requirements. The expanded reporting is in accordance with the State’s enhanced focus on the housing development process.

All residential building permits must be tracked through to their final grant of occupancy. Only units that receive issuance of a building permit during the reporting period are counted toward the jurisdiction’s RHNA allocation. Notwithstanding the interest in the jurisdiction’s performance on providing affordable housing to lower income households, the APR requires detailed permit information on all residential units.

The contents of the APR are described below along with their applicability to the City of Visalia.

	Table Name	Description
Table A	Housing development applications submitted	Lists all applications deemed complete in 2023. Examples: Subdivision Maps, Conditional Use Permits, Site Plan Review applications receiving a “Revise & Proceed” and needing no further entitlements.
Table A2	Annual building activity report summary	Lists all housing units that have received an entitlement, issued and/or finalized building permit in 2023. Examples: building permits for single-family, multi-family, and accessory dwelling units, applications listed in Table A.
Table B	Regional Housing Needs Allocation (RHNA) Progress	Summary of permits issued by income level in each year of RHNA allocation.
Table C	Sites identified / rezoned to accommodate shortfall housing need	N/A for Visalia. The City maintains a surplus in all levels.
Table D	Housing Element Program implementation status	Reports on all mid-cycle update to the 5 th Cycle Housing Element programs.
Table E	Commercial development bonuses approved	N/A for Visalia. No such applications received in reporting period.
Table F	Units rehabilitated, preserved and acquired for alternative adequate sites	N/A for Visalia. Optional table.
Table F2	Above moderate income units converted to moderate income units	N/A for Visalia. Optional table.

Table G	Locally owned lands included in Housing Element sites inventory that have been sold, leased, or disposed	N/A for Visalia. No locally owned inventoried land has been sold.
Table H	Locally Owned or Controlled Lands Declared Surplus	Lists sites designated as surplus. Currently none of these sites contain housing.
Table J	Student housing development with a density bonus approved	N/A for Visalia. No student housing applied for.
Table K	Tenant Preference Policy	N/A for Visalia. No tenant preference policy adopted by City. New table for 2023.
Summary	Summary of data from preceding tables	Summary of data from preceding tables
LEAP Reporting	Status of proposed uses listed in LEAP application and the corresponding impact on housing	Reports the City's progress on its LEAP grant, which was approved in 2021.

Summary of Report:

Table A: Application Submittal Summary

- **Entitlement Applications.** Entitlement applications reflecting a total of 1,878 units were submitted and deemed complete in 2023. This includes:
 - seven subdivisions totaling 1,571 single-family residential units (see Table A),
 - one conditional use permit (CUP) application for 168 market-rate apartment dwelling units associated with the Belissa Residential Community subdivision,
 - one CUP application for a residence in an Office Conversion zone, and
 - two parcel maps yielding 5 dwelling units.
- **Site Plan Review by-right uses.** Units tallied through Site Plan Review applications for by-right uses receiving a “Revise & Proceed” are approximately 167 units over six projects. This includes:
 - one 94-unit deed-restricted Very Low and Low Income development (Colegio West, Dinuba & Glendale, Self-Help Enterprises), and
 - one 42-unit deed-restricted Extremely Low Income hotel conversion utilizing Homekey funds (Majestic Gardens, 4545 W. Noble Avenue, RHC Development LP).

Table A2: Building Activity

Comparative data sets between the 2023 and the previous four years’ APR submittals are shown in the tables below:

<u>Residential Permit Category</u>	<u>2019</u>	<u>2020</u>	<u>2021</u>	<u>2022</u>	<u>2023</u>
Issued building permits:					
ADUs	4	2	5	16	22
Single-Family Units	633	599	632	540	317
Multi-Family Units	61	6	204	695	12
Granted occupancy:					
ADUs	1	3	4	8	20
Single-Family Units	529	571	590	651	448
Multi-Family Units	72	38	2	43	296

<u>Affordability by Income (issued permits)</u>	<u>2019</u>	<u>2020</u>	<u>2021</u>	<u>2022</u>	<u>2023</u>
Above Moderate	169	92	76	124	165
Moderate	463	504	548	411	156
Low	46	10	170	657	16
Very Low	20	1	40	21	11
Extremely Low	0	0	7	38	3
TOTAL	698	607	841	1251	351

- **Conditional Use Permits approved in 2023.** Three CUPs were approved in January and February 2023 for apartment complexes containing a total of 847 units deed restricted for Extremely Low, Very Low, and Low Income Categories plus nine managers units. The three projects were located at Demaree & Houston, Ben Maddox & K, and Lovers & Caldwell. These projects do not appear in Table A because their entitlement applications were deemed complete in the prior calendar year.
- **Multi-Family Residential.** The 12 multi-family units that were issued permits are classified as affordable to the Low Income category based on the density of the units' underlying zone district. The units are associated with the Village at Shannon Parkway apartment complex located at Shannon Parkway & Court Street, which in 2022 had permits issued for the balance of the project (i.e., 204 units).
- **Deed Restricted Affordability.** There were no permits issued in 2023 for deed restricted units.
- **Single-Family Residential - Very Low Income Affordability.** A total of 14 accessory dwelling units (ADUs) were issued permits classified as

affordable to the Very Low Income category based on total valuation of the permit and number of bedrooms.

- **Single-Family Residential - Low Income Affordability.** A total of four ADUs were issued permits classified as affordable to the Low Income category based on total valuation of the permit and number of bedrooms.
- **Single-Family Residential - Moderate & Above Moderate Affordability.** A total of three ADUs and 152 single-family residences are classified as affordable to the Moderate Income category, and one ADU and 165 single-family residences are classified as affordable to the Above Moderate Income category, based on total valuation of the permit and number of bedrooms.
- **Affordability Determination.** Like in previous reporting years, affordability in the 2023 reporting year was determined based on an affordability calculator made available by State HCD through their website.

Table B: Regional Housing Needs Assessment (RHNA) Compliance:

There were no discretionary actions that affected the City’s RHNA obligations. Consequently, the RHNA remains in compliance with the Housing Element and State law.

Table D: Housing Element Implementation:

There were no program accomplishments that involved changes to the City’s Zoning Ordinance in 2023. There were several outreach and financial accomplishments that took place in 2023.

The City held 3 public hearings and 2 community meetings covering CDBG, HOME, and NSP funded programs, which included affordable housing programs (Program 1.5 – Housing Education; Program 3.7 – Inform Public).

Maps illustrating the City’s infill site inventory were updated in October 2023 (Program 2.1 – Infill Site Inventory).

Rancho Colegio (80 units) and Demaree Apartments (220 units), new construction affordable housing projects, were awarded Low-Income Tax Credits (Program 3.4 – Low Income Tax Credits).

The City awarded an additional \$425,000 in LMIHAF to the Majestic Gardens project for the development of permanent housing for extremely-low income households at 30% AMI or lower (Program 3.18 – Targeting Extremely Low Income Developments).

The City provided \$118,000 in PLHA funds for a Seasonal Emergency Low-Barrier Shelter (Warming Center), and \$263,795 for a transitional bridge housing project called Eden House for people experiencing homelessness. The City also provided an additional \$1,129,275 in CDBG funds for the development of a 100-bed Low-Barrier Navigation Center. (Program 5.2 – Homeless Shelter Program).

The City provided HOME funds for the development of 5 single-family homes. One of the homes was fully accessible and 4 homes were ADA adaptable (Program 5.8 – Housing for Persons with Developmental Disabilities).

Housing Element Annual Report

The Housing Element contains three implementation programs that require an annual report to the Planning Commission on certain topics that help to better facilitate the construction of affordable housing or housing for lower income groups. The programs and the corresponding reports are below. Information from the 2022 calendar year is also provided since no annual report was given to the Commission in 2023.

Program 1.4: Conditional Use Permit Process for Multi-Family Projects. This program requires that the City annually assess the Conditional Use Permit (CUP) process for multi-family residential projects greater than 80 housing units to ensure that the entitlement process does not adversely impact the timing, cost, or supply of multi-family development. Such an assessment shall be provided to the Planning Commission.

In the 2023 calendar year, the Planning Commission considered three CUPs that were required for a multi-family project in the R-M-2, R-M-3, and/or non-residential zone districts in excess of 80 units:

- Conditional Use Permit No. 2022-21: A request by Maracor Development to establish a 222-unit multi-family residential development on 7.61 acres in the R-M-3 (Multi-Family Residential, 1,200 sq. ft. minimum site area) and O-PA (Professional/Administrative Office) zones. The project site is located on the southwest corner of West Houston Avenue and North Demaree Street (APNs: 077-660-021, 077-660-022 & 077-660-024). The Planning Commission considered and approved this CUP on January 9, 2023.
- Conditional Use Permit No. 2022-23: A request by Maracor Development to establish a 292-unit multi-family residential development on 10.8 acres in the R-M-2 (Multi-Family Residential, 3,000 sq. ft. minimum site area) zone. The project site is located on the southwest corner of East K Avenue and South Ben Maddox Way (APNs: 126-750-050 & 126-750-051). The Planning Commission considered and approved this CUP on January 9, 2023, and the City Council upheld an appeal of the Planning Commission's approval on February 6, 2023.
- Conditional Use Permit No. 2022-25: A request by Maracor Development for the development of a 342-unit deed restricted affordability apartment complex on property totaling 11.41 acres and containing a zoning designation of Commercial Mixed Use (C-MU). The project site is located on the northwest corner of South Lovers Lane and East Caldwell Avenue (APN 126-850-029). The Planning Commission considered and approved this CUP on January 23, 2023.

In the 2022 calendar year, the Planning Commission considered one CUP that was required for a multi-family project in the R-M-2 zone district in excess of 80 units:

- Conditional Use Permit No. 2022-09: A request by JH Real Estate Partners Inc. to allow a 234 unit, two- and three-story apartment complex on two parcels measuring 15.7 acres combined and zoned R-M-2 (Multi-Family Residential, one unit per 3,000 square

feet). The project is located on the northeast corner of North Court Street and East Riggin Avenue. (Address not assigned) (APNs: 079-310-004 & 079-310-005). The Planning Commission considered and approved this CUP on June 27, 2022.

With regards to timing, the following dates describe when the project was received, deemed complete, and received a public hearing.

	<u>Entitlement Filed</u>	<u>Entitlement Deemed Complete</u>	<u>Public Hearing</u>
CUP 2022-09	4/11/2022	5/3/2022 (1 month)	6/27/2022 (2.5 months)
CUP 2022-21	8/8/2022	11/21/2022 (3 months)	1/9/2023 (5 months)
CUP 2022-23	8/22/2022	11/21/2022 (3 months)	1/9/2023 (4.5 months)
CUP 2022-25	9/8/2022	11/21/2022 (3 months)	1/23/2023 (4.5 months)

CUP 2022-09 Background: The R-M-2 zone provides for multi-family development in the range of 10 to 15 dwelling units per acre. The minimum number of units required for this site based on minimum density and gross acreage was 157 units, but also based upon the underlying Orchard Walk Specific Plan which stated that the area will provide approximately 224 units. Therefore, a CUP was necessary for any project occupying the entire site.

As described above, this project received approval of a CUP in less than 3 months from the time of initial submittal, which meets the estimated 3-month total processing time for this project as indicated in Housing Element Table 1-51. The CUP process and the associated cost was not considered a deterrent to the number of units associated with the project since the applicant was able to achieve the desired unit count and product type associated with their application. The project first submitted to Site Plan Review on January 19, 2022, and so the total processing time including Site Plan Review was between 4 to 5 months. The project did receive public opposition from existing single-family residential homeowners living nearby, though it did not result in any factors causing the Planning Commission to vote against the project.

CUP 2022-21, 2022-23, and 2022-25 Background: These three projects were all deed-restricted affordable housing apartment complexed proposed by the same developer. All projects were eligible for concessions under the State Density Bonus Program, and one project at ben Maddox & K utilized an 80% density bonus above the R-M-2 density limit on account of the project’s deed restricted affordability. The projects were located in one or more of the following zoning designations: R-M-2, R-M-3, O-PA, and C-MU. Only one project was in an exclusively non-residential zone. Furthermore, all projects exceeded 80 units, and therefore a CUP was necessary for each project.

As described above, all projects received approval of a CUP between 4-5 months from the time of initial submittal, which exceeded the estimated 3-month total processing time for this project as indicated in Housing Element Table 1-51. Reasons cited for the additional processing time were that the City staff person managing the projects resigned during this period leaving the City to search for and hire contract employees, and due to the project applicant needing to provide further clarification in their request toward development concessions and reduced parking standards in a project utilizing a State Density Bonus. The CUP process and the associated cost was not considered a

deterrent to the number of units associated with the project since the applicant was able to achieve the desired unit count and product type associated with their application, and was able to apply for outside funding sources such as Low Income Tax Housing Credits. The projects first submitted to Site Plan Review on April 27, 2022 and on July 6, 2022, and so the total processing time including Site Plan Review ranged between 8 to 9 months. Two of the three projects did receive significant public opposition from existing single-family residential homeowners living nearby, with one of the projects being appealed to the City Council. These factors did not result in causing the Planning Commission or the City Council to vote against the project.

Program 2.5: Incentives for Infill Affordable Housing. This program requires that the City annually report to the Planning Commission projects that meet the threshold criteria and take advantage of the Affordable Housing Infill Incentive Program. This program reduces Transportation Impact Fees up to 60% of the base fee for residential projects in qualifying infill sites. This program became effective November 16, 2017, in fulfillment of a previously established Housing Element Program.

In the calendar year 2022 and 2023, one project was issued a building permit which took advantage of this Program – the 80-unit Lofts at Fort Visalia project by Self-Help Enterprises.

Program 9.4: CUP Requirement Impacts on Affordable Housing. This program requires that the City monitor every proposed development on RHNA land inventory sites to ensure that the effects of processing a CUP, when required, does not unreasonably delay entitlement processing, increase development costs in a manner that eliminates potential affordability, or affect potential development density. The City must annually report to the Planning Commission the effect of CUP requirements compared with comparable “permitted by right” projects. This is to ensure that the CUP processing and conditions do not adversely affect the project’s affordability.

In the 2022 and 2023 calendar years, three of the four CUPs that the City processed were located on RHNA land inventory sites (the fourth CUP site did not have a RHNA site inventory listing because the site was entirely commercially zoned and vacant). The two CUPs described above were for sites that were inventoried for lower income housing sites. One site was approved for deed-restricted affordable housing, while the other site was approved for market-rate housing at a density that is considered to be affordable to low income households. One CUP described above was for a site inventoried for above moderate income housing, but was approved through the CUP for deed-restricted affordable housing.

Attachments

- 2023 Annual Progress Report

ANNUAL ELEMENT PROGRESS REPORT
Housing Element Implementation

How to use this table: An optional field

Element ID	Element Name	Element Type	Priority	Start Date	End Date	Status	Progress	Notes
10000001	10000001
10000002	10000002
10000003	10000003
10000004	10000004
10000005	10000005
10000006	10000006
10000007	10000007
10000008	10000008
10000009	10000009
10000010	10000010
10000011	10000011
10000012	10000012
10000013	10000013
10000014	10000014
10000015	10000015
10000016	10000016
10000017	10000017
10000018	10000018
10000019	10000019
10000020	10000020
10000021	10000021
10000022	10000022
10000023	10000023
10000024	10000024
10000025	10000025
10000026	10000026
10000027	10000027
10000028	10000028
10000029	10000029
10000030	10000030
10000031	10000031
10000032	10000032
10000033	10000033
10000034	10000034
10000035	10000035
10000036	10000036
10000037	10000037
10000038	10000038
10000039	10000039
10000040	10000040
10000041	10000041
10000042	10000042
10000043	10000043
10000044	10000044
10000045	10000045
10000046	10000046
10000047	10000047
10000048	10000048
10000049	10000049
10000050	10000050
10000051	10000051
10000052	10000052
10000053	10000053
10000054	10000054
10000055	10000055
10000056	10000056
10000057	10000057
10000058	10000058
10000059	10000059
10000060	10000060
10000061	10000061
10000062	10000062
10000063	10000063
10000064	10000064
10000065	10000065
10000066	10000066
10000067	10000067
10000068	10000068
10000069	10000069
10000070	10000070
10000071	10000071
10000072	10000072
10000073	10000073
10000074	10000074
10000075	10000075
10000076	10000076
10000077	10000077
10000078	10000078
10000079	10000079
10000080	10000080
10000081	10000081
10000082	10000082
10000083	10000083
10000084	10000084
10000085	10000085
10000086	10000086
10000087	10000087
10000088	10000088
10000089	10000089
10000090	10000090
10000091	10000091
10000092	10000092
10000093	10000093
10000094	10000094
10000095	10000095
10000096	10000096
10000097	10000097
10000098	10000098
10000099	10000099
10000100	10000100

Reporting Year: 2022
Reporting Period: 10/1/2021 - 9/30/2022

ANNUAL ELEMENT PROGRESS REPORT
Housing Element Implementation

How to use this report: An optional field
Click on the cell to view details.

Element ID	Element Name	Element Type	Priority	Start Date	End Date	Status	Progress	Notes
10000001	10000001
10000002	10000002
10000003	10000003
10000004	10000004
10000005	10000005
10000006	10000006
10000007	10000007
10000008	10000008
10000009	10000009
10000010	10000010
10000011	10000011
10000012	10000012
10000013	10000013
10000014	10000014
10000015	10000015
10000016	10000016
10000017	10000017
10000018	10000018
10000019	10000019
10000020	10000020
10000021	10000021
10000022	10000022
10000023	10000023
10000024	10000024
10000025	10000025
10000026	10000026
10000027	10000027
10000028	10000028
10000029	10000029
10000030	10000030
10000031	10000031
10000032	10000032
10000033	10000033
10000034	10000034
10000035	10000035
10000036	10000036
10000037	10000037
10000038	10000038
10000039	10000039
10000040	10000040
10000041	10000041
10000042	10000042
10000043	10000043
10000044	10000044
10000045	10000045
10000046	10000046
10000047	10000047
10000048	10000048
10000049	10000049
10000050	10000050
10000051	10000051
10000052	10000052
10000053	10000053
10000054	10000054
10000055	10000055
10000056	10000056
10000057	10000057
10000058	10000058
10000059	10000059
10000060	10000060
10000061	10000061
10000062	10000062
10000063	10000063
10000064	10000064
10000065	10000065
10000066	10000066
10000067	10000067
10000068	10000068
10000069	10000069
10000070	10000070
10000071	10000071
10000072	10000072
10000073	10000073
10000074	10000074
10000075	10000075
10000076	10000076
10000077	10000077
10000078	10000078
10000079	10000079
10000080	10000080
10000081	10000081
10000082	10000082
10000083	10000083
10000084	10000084
10000085	10000085
10000086	10000086
10000087	10000087
10000088	10000088
10000089	10000089
10000090	10000090
10000091	10000091
10000092	10000092
10000093	10000093
10000094	10000094
10000095	10000095
10000096	10000096
10000097	10000097
10000098	10000098
10000099	10000099
10000100	10000100

Jurisdiction	Visalia	
Reporting Year	2023	(Jan. 1 - Dec. 31)
Planning Period	5th Cycle	12/31/2015 - 12/31/2023

ANNUAL ELEMENT PROGRESS REPORT Housing Element Implementation

This table is auto-populated once you enter your jurisdiction name and current year data. Past year information comes from previous APRs.
Please contact HCD if your data is different than the material supplied here

Table B														
Regional Housing Needs Allocation Progress														
Permitted Units Issued by Affordability														
		1	2									3	4	
Income Level		RHNA Allocation by Income Level	2015	2016	2017	2018	2019	2020	2021	2022	2023	Total Units to Date (all years)	Total Remaining RHNA by Income Level	
Very Low	Deed Restricted	2,616	-	9	36	2	-	-	-	43	100	-	280	2,336
	Non-Deed Restricted		-	-	42	-	-	20	1	4	9	14		
Low	Deed Restricted	1,931	-	106	-	72	-	-	-	22	34	-	1,281	650
	Non-Deed Restricted		-	-	118	-	86	46	10	148	623	16		
Moderate	Deed Restricted	1,802	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	2,624	-
	Non-Deed Restricted		-	132	279	29	102	463	504	548	411	156		
Above Moderate		3,672	-	367	246	403	391	169	92	76	124	165	2,033	1,639
Total RHNA		10,021												
Total Units			-	614	721	506	579	698	607	841	1,301	351	6,218	4,625
Progress toward extremely low-income housing need, as determined pursuant to Government Code 65583(a)(1).														
		5	6									7		
		Extremely low-income Need	2015	2016	2017	2018	2019	2020	2021	2022	2023	Total Units to Date	Total Units Remaining	
Extremely Low-Income Units*		1,308	-	-	-	-	-	-	7	87	3	97	1,211	

*Extremely low-income housing need determined pursuant to Government Code 65583(a)(1). Value in Section 5 is default value, assumed to be half of the very low-income RHNA. May be overwritten.

Please Note: Table B does not currently contain data from Table F or Table F2 for prior years. You may login to the APR system to see Table B that contains this data.

Note: units serving extremely low-income households are included in the very low-income RHNA progress and must be reported as very low-income units in section 7 of Table A2. They must also be reported in the extremely low-income category (section 13) in Table A2 to be counted as progress toward meeting the extremely low-income housing need determined pursuant to Government Code 65583(a)(1).

Please note: For the last year of the 5th cycle, Table B will only include units that were permitted during the portion of the year that was in the 5th cycle. For the first year of the 6th cycle, Table B will only include units that were permitted since the start of the planning period. Projection Period units are in a separate column.

Please note: The APR form can only display data for one planning period. To view progress for a different planning period, you may login to HCD's online APR system, or contact HCD staff at apr@hcd.ca.gov.

ANNUAL ELEMENT PROGRESS REPORT

Housing Element Implementation

Jurisdiction	Visalia		
Reporting Year	2023	(Jan. 1 - Dec. 31)	
Table D			
Program Implementation Status pursuant to GC Section 65583			
Housing Programs Progress Report			
Describe progress of all programs including local efforts to remove governmental constraints to the maintenance, improvement, and development of housing as identified in the housing element.			
1	2	3	4
Name of Program	Objective	Timeframe in H.E	Status of Program Implementation
HE Program 1.1 DESIGNATE FOR SUFFICIENT LAND	No net loss of land designated for Median, Low, Very Low, and Extremely Low Income Categories	Annually	A sufficient balance of all income categories continues to exist. There was no loss of land designated for these categories in 2023. While there were General Plan Amendment and Change of Zone entitlements processed in 2023, none resulted in a reduction of land designations for these income categories.
HE Program 1.2 CONTACT WITH CITY OFFICIALS	Conduct one discussion session by the Building Advisory Committee (BAC) quarterly meeting, and report back to the Committee on any issues raised within two CRC Quarterly meetings.	Annually	There was one meeting of the Building Advisory Committee held in 2023: on March 30. No discussion was voiced by members or attendees regarding specific controls or building standards that would discourage affordable or multi-family housing.
HE Program 1.3 SENIOR HOUSING RESIDENTIAL DEVELOPMENT BY RIGHT	Complete Ordinance Amendment within one year of Housing Element certification.	2020	Completed in 2021. No changes in 2023.
HE Program 1.4 CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT PROCESS	Provide a report to the Planning Commission on an annual basis that summarizes all multi-family residential projects considered by the Commission.	Annually	During 2023, the Planning Commission considered three multi-family residential development projects, all of which was over 80 units and all of which are affordable housing projects. All projects were considered by the Commission within two months of being deemed complete. A report for the 2023 year is anticipated to be presented to the Commission in April 2024.

HE Program 1.5 HOUSING EDUCATION	Schedule, coordinate and conduct at least one subject public meeting or stakeholder group seminar per year	Annually	In 2023 the City held 3 public hearings and 2 community meetings covering CDBG, HOME, and NSP funded programs, which included affordable housing programs. The Housing Authority of Tulare County annually hosts a public meeting to go over the Moving to Work Program Plan, which incorporates both the Section 8 and Public Housing Program. The public meeting takes place in mid-January of every year. Self-Help Enterprises (SHE) operates the Gateway program, which educates the public about affordable housing opportunities and provide direct homeownership preparedness and one-on-one counseling including credit counseling, budgeting, and general financial literacy.
HE Program 1.6 PROJECT STATUS REPORT	Meet all prescribed processing timelines as contained in the City's Zoning Ordinance and Community Development Department policies and procedures. Establish a tracking system for length of time taken to process entitlement requests. Staff shall review the tracking system on an ongoing basis to assess where specific types of permits can be processed more efficiently.	Daily, Ongoing	The City continues to utilize its electronic permitting software (Accela) to track the progress and length of time for development processing against established goals, striving to establish industry leading review times, while continuing to monitor the efficiency for various permit types to improve further. In 2023, the Community Development Department was able to build upon the successes seen in 2022, ensuring permit processing timelines were met. These efforts resulted in the City having 0 over-target permits for the year.
HE Program 2.1 INFILL SITE INVENTORY	Inventory document to be maintained at Community Development front counter and on City website, and to be updated on an annual basis.	Annually	The infill site inventory is maintained (updated in October 2023) and kept at the Community Development front counter as well as online at https://www.visalia.city/depts/community_development/planning/planning_information/default.asp .
HE Program 2.2 INCENTIVES FOR DOWNTOWN HOUSING	Five units of residential converted from commercial space, or one new multi-family residential project per year.	Ongoing	In 2023 there were no projects involving new or conversion of existing space toward residential uses in the downtown.
HE Program 2.3 INFRASTRUCTURE FUNDING PROGRAM	Apply for at least one qualifying grant	Annually	In 2023 the City applied for four grants related to infrastructure projects. Two projects were awarded and one is still pending notice of an award. The awards received were for the improvements to a paved pedestrian/bike trail along Goshen Avenue that include accessibility and safety improvements, as well as for improvements allowing for a linear recharge basin in Cameron Creek.
HE Program 2.4 MIXED USE DEVELOPMENT	At least one qualifying project per year	Ongoing	In 2023 there were no projects involving mixed uses in the downtown that were issued building permits.
HE Program 2.5 INCENTIVES FOR INFILL AFFORDABLE HOUSING	Provide a report to the Planning Commission on an annual basis that summarizes projects that have utilized the	Annually	In 2023, there have been no developments that have met the requirements and/or utilized the incentive of the fee reduction.
HE Program 2.6 DOWNTOWN AND MIXED USE RESIDENTIAL DEVELOPMENT BY RIGHT	Complete Ordinance Amendment and study within one year of Housing Element certification.	2020	Completed in 2021. No changes in 2023.

HE Program 3.1 LEGISLATIVE RELIEF	N/A	Ongoing	The City Council has adopted positions related to State legislation and Federal legislation, related to the promotion of the development of affordable, sustainable, and accessible housing, and the promotion of funding towards grants and housing. The City also submitted several stance letters in 2023 on state legislation regarding housing and/or homelessness. In addition, the City has received six letters of support from various State Assembly and Senate members in support of Encampment Resolution <u>funding towards construction of the Visalia Navigation Center.</u>
HE Program 3.2 MULTIPLE-FAMILY DEVELOPMENTS	Develop 400 multi-family units (20 extremely low, 40 very low, 60 low, and 80 moderate, and 200 above moderate) over the four year period.	Annually	In 2023 the City issued permits for 12 multi-family units for a total of 913 units in the four-year period between 2020 and 2023. During 2023, three CUP entitlements for multi-family residential development projects totalling 847 extremely/very low and low income deed-restricted affordable units were approved. All projects were considered by the Planning Commission within two months of being deemed complete. Two additional Site Plan Review entitlements for multi-family residential development projects totalling 136 extremely/very low and low <u>income deed-restricted affordable units were approved.</u>
HE Program 3.3 FIRST-TIME HOMEBUYER	Assist 50 low- and moderate-income first-time homebuyers over the next five years.	Ongoing	In 2023, the City completed five (5) HOME funded first-time homebuyer and three (3) NSP first-time homebuyer loans as gap financing toward the purchase of a single-
HE Program 3.4 MORTGAGE REVENUE BONDS, MORTGAGE CREDIT CERTIFICATES, LOW INCOME TAX	Provide technical assistance for the issuance of one mortgage revenue bond, mortgage credit certificate, or low income tax credit funded project.	Ongoing	In 2023, Rancho Colegio a 80-unit and Demaree Apartments a 220-unit new construction affordable housing projects were awarded Low-Income Tax Credits.
HE Program 3.5 FHA/HUD/HCD AND FEDERAL HOUSING TRUST PROGRAMS OR AVAILABLE GOVERNMENT	Contact local affordable housing borrowers at least annually to provide the most updated and any new information on available programs.	Ongoing	In 2023, affordable housing borrowers were notified of CDBG funded owner occupied single-family and mobilehome repair programs at no cost to the homeowner.
HE Program 3.6 SECTION 8 HOUSING ASSISTANCE PROGRAM	Assist 550 lower income families with rental housing assistance annually.	Ongoing	In 2023, the City provided 111 emergency on-time rental assistance to prevent homelessness to lower-income families. The Housing Authority continues to oversee approximately 2,850 housing choice vouchers, 179 public housing units, and 764 affordable housing units in the City of Visalia.
HE Program 3.7 INFORM PUBLIC OF LOCAL, STATE, AND FEDERAL HOUSING PROGRAMS	Conduct at least one presentation annually to the local real estate industry and/or nongovernmental organizations regarding available housing programs.	Ongoing	The City conducted three public hearings and two community meetings explaining current and upcoming affordable housing programs with the use of CDBG and HOME funds.
HE Program 3.8 LOAN PROGRAM EDUCATION	Sponsor annual or bi-annual meetings to educate realtors, home buyers, and others to facilitate promotion of this program, as funding is available.	Ongoing	The City funded first-time homebuyer counseling workshops in 2023.

HE Program 3.9 AGENCY COORDINATION	Provide information on a recurring basis.	Ongoing	The City works closely with Tulare County Association of Realtors and the Home Building Industry Association (BIA) and regularly informing real estate organizations of the City's need for lower income housing sites and incentive programs available to encourage the creation of such housing.
HE Program 3.10 AVAILABILITY OF FUNDING INCLUDING LAND WRITE-DOWN	Complete ten applications under this program per year.	Ongoing	The City receives annual federal CDBG and HOME funding from HUD and state PLHA annual funding for HCD. In 2023, the City was awarded state Homekey and Encampment Resolution Funding funds.
HE Program 3.11 CITY INCENTIVE FOR AFFORDABLE HOUSING	Identify non-governmental organization affordable housing providers and explore opportunities for land purchases.	Ongoing	In 2023, the City provided incentives to encourage affordable housing production by offering deferred financing to decrease the total cost of housing production.
HE Program 3.12 DEVELOPMENT FEE REDUCTION/DEFERMENT	Complete the review and present to City Council for final consideration.	2020	Completed in 2022. No changes in 2023.
HE Program 3.13 NON-PROFIT HOUSING DEVELOPMENT CORPORATIONS	Provide assistance that will benefit 20 first-time lower income home buyers over the next four years.	Ongoing	Five (5) single-family homes were constructed with use of HOME development funds along with HOME and NSP funds for secondary financing to benefit first-time lower income home buyers.
HE Program 3.14 LAND BANKING	Participate in at least one land banking project during the current reporting period.	Ongoing	The City does not use funding to landbank. However, in 2023 five single-family homes were constructed on city surplus lots that were purchased by Self Help Enterprises for the development of low-income first-time homebuyers.
HE Program 3.15 PROMOTING ACCESSORY DWELLING UNITS	Achieve five accessory dwelling units per year for a total of twenty units over the next four years.	Ongoing	The City issued 20 permits for accessory dwelling units in 2023. In total the City had 22 permits for accessory dwelling units applied for in 2023.
HE Program 3.16 ASSISTED HOUSING PROJECTS ELIGIBLE FOR CONVERSION	Achieve 100% contact with all subject at-risk property owners one year before contract expiration.	Annually	The City has continued to monitor properties on an annual basis and has not found any properties at-risk of converting to market rate in 2023.
HE Program 3.17 PLANNING FOR LARGE SITES	Entitle a minimum of one master planned project on a RHNA listed site per year.	Ongoing	In 2023 the City approved entitlements for two new residential-focused specific plans, on 95 acres (Pratt Family Ranch) and on 500 acres (Carleton Acres). One site (Carleton Acres) is RHNA listed.
HE Program 3.18 TARGETING EXTREMELY-LOW INCOME DEVELOPMENTS	Annually pursue State and Federal funds to increase the supply of housing affordable to extreme low-income households.	Ongoing	In 2023, the City awarded an additional \$425,000 in LMIHAF to the Majestic Gardens project for the development of permanent housing for extremely-low income households at 30% AMI or lower.
HE Program 3.19 CONSISTENCY WITH STATE DENSITY BONUS LAW	Complete review of state law and complete ordinance amendments, as necessary, within one year of Housing Element certification. Any applications received for density bonuses that are found to be consistent with state law shall be processed and implemented immediately.	2020 and ongoing	Completed in 2021. No changes in 2023. The City in 2023 approved entitlements for three applications utilizing a density bonus or incentives in accordance with State Density Bonus Law.

HE Program 3.20 PROVIDE PRIORITY SEWER SERVICE FOR AFFORDABLE HOUSING	Identify all projects meeting the criteria for affordable housing and ensure their first priority status to connect to the City sanitary sewer system.	Ongoing	Capacity and infrastructure are sufficient for all anticipated growth, including affordable housing.
HE Program 3.21 removed from Final Adopted Housing Element	Removed from housing element.	n/a	Not applicable.
HE Program 3.22 MOBILE HOME PARKS IN HIGH DENSITY RESIDENTIAL ZONE DISTRICT	Complete Ordinance Amendment within one year of Housing Element certification.	2020	Completed in 2020. No changes in 2023.
HE Program 3.23 ACCESSORY DWELLING UNITS STANDARD BUILDING PLANS	Prepare standard building plans within two years of Housing Element certification.	2021	Completed in 2022. In 2023, the plans were updated to be consistent with 2022 Building Code. The City continued to promote the units through its website and by staffing a table at two community events.
HE Program 4.1 HOMEBUYER EDUCATION PROGRAM OUTREACH	Participate in at least one education seminar per year.	Ongoing	In 2023, the City utilized HOME and NSP funds for first time homebuyer assistance including homebuyer education. The City also promotes Self-Help Enterprises and CSET's homebuyer education services on the City website.
HE Program 4.2 FORECLOSURE PREVENTION	Verify that the correct and up to date information is posted to City website, and updated on at least an annual basis.	Ongoing	Foreclosure prevention and services offered by HUD-approved housing counseling agencies are posted on the City website. The City also refers people to CSET and Self-Help Enterprises for services.
HE Program 4.3 NUISANCE ABATEMENT IN IMPACTED NEIGHBORHOODS	Secure properties subject to the emergency nuisance abatement within 72 hours of appraisal, and establish a tracking system for managing nuisance abatement cases and report activity in the Annual Report.	Ongoing	In 2023 the City boarded 14 unsecured properties. The City's goal has been to secure properties within 24 hours of appraisal, well in excess of the 72 hour objective.
HE Program 4.4 FORECLOSURE ACQUISITION	Annually pursue State and Federal funds when available.	Ongoing	In 2023, the City did not acquire any foreclosed properties since it did not have NSP program funding for this program.
HE Program 5.1 LEGISLATIVE AWARENESS	Participate in at least two legislative initiatives per year.	Ongoing	The City Council has adopted positions related to State legislation and Federal legislation, related to the promotion of the development of affordable, sustainable, and accessible housing, and the promotion of funding towards grants and housing. The City also submitted several stance letters in 2023 on state legislation regarding housing and/or homelessness. In addition, the City has received six letters of support from various State Assembly and Senate members in support of Encampment Resolution funding towards construction of the Visalia Navigation Center.
HE Program 5.2 HOMELESS SHELTER PROGRAM	Annually allocate funding to provide assistance and supportive services.	Ongoing	In 2023, the City provided \$118,000 in PLHA funds for a Seasonal Emergency Low-Barrier Shelter (Warming Center), and \$263,795 for a transitional bridge housing project called Eden House for people experiencing homelessness. The City also provided an additional \$1,129,275 in CDBG funds for the development of a 100-bed

HE Program 5.3 EMERGENCY SHELTERS PERFORMANCE STANDARDS AND EXPANSION OF ALLOWED USE	Complete Ordinance Amendment and study within one year of Housing Element certification.	2020	Completed in 2022. No changes in 2023.
HE Program 5.4 REASONABLE ACCOMMODATION	Maintain an updated brochure at City offices and on City website	Ongoing	The brochure is available at the front counter and has been posted on the City website https://www.visalia.city/depts/community_development/planning/gp.asp . To date there have been no known requests by the public for reasonable accommodation.
HE Program 5.5 SENIOR RENTAL HOUSING	Facilitate the construction of at least 10 very low-income and 10 low-income senior units during the reporting period.	Ongoing	In 2023 no building permits were issued for senior rental units.
HE Program 5.6 REHABILITATION ASSISTANCE FOR SENIOR & DISABLED HOMEOWNERS	Provide assistance that will benefit ten (10) households per year over the next four years. Track assistance accomplishments and include in the Annual Report.	Ongoing	The City assisted two (2) senior and/or disabled low-income owner occupants with mobile home repairs in 2023.
HE Program 5.7 LARGE FAMILIES	Facilitate the construction of at least 16 units per year (8 very low- and 8 low-	Ongoing	None of the low-income dwelling units constructed in 2023 were units with three or more bedrooms.
HE Program 5.8 HOUSING FOR PERSONS WITH DEVELOPMENTAL DISABILITIES	Annually pursue State and Federal funds that can support housing construction and maintenance of housing for persons with disabilities.	Ongoing	In 2023, the City provided HOME funds for the development of 5 single-family homes. One of the homes were fully accessible and 4 homes were ADA adaptable.
HE Program 5.9 EMPLOYEE HOUSING ALLOWED WHERE RAISING OF HORTICULTURAL ITEMS	Complete Ordinance Amendment within one year of Housing Element certification.	2020	Completed in 2020. No changes in 2023.
HE Program 5.10 ADULT OVERNIGHT RESIDENTIAL CARE FACILITY IN MULTI- FAMILY ZONE DISTRICTS	Complete Ordinance Amendment within one year of Housing Element certification.	2020	Completed in 2020. No changes in 2023.
HE Program 6.1 HOUSING REHABILITATION	Assist 25 low-income homeowners during the course of the current reporting period.	Ongoing	In 2023, the City provided 2 single-family homes and 2 mobile homes with owner occupied housing rehabilitation.
HE Program 6.2 LOW- INCOME RENTAL REHABILITATION	Assist twenty (20) low-income owners of rental properties with forgivable loans over the next four years.	Ongoing	Self-Help Enterprises provides rental rehabilitation, which the City supports through funding. The City has successfully partnered with Self-Help Enterprises to rehabilitate rental units. No units acquired during 2023.
HE Program 6.3 EMERGENCY REPAIRS PROGRAM	Assist twenty (20) low-income homeowners over the next four years.	Ongoing	In 2023, City utilized CDBG funds to Habitat for Humanity to administer a Emergency Repair & Accessibility Repair Program (ERAP) and Self-Help Enterprises (SHE) to administer a Senior Mobile Home Repair Program (SMHRP). Habitat for Humanity assisted 2 homes with emergency minor home repairs including addressing housing code violations. SHE assisted 2 mobile homes with essential repairs.

HE Program 6.4 ENFORCEMENT OF HOUSING AND BUILDING CODES	Complete fifty (50) residential inspections per year in response to substandard building or living condition referrals.	Ongoing	In 2023, Neighborhood Preservation responded to 155 substandard housing complaints.
HE Program 6.5 REHABILITATION AND ADAPTIVE REUSE	Assist with rehabilitating one unit per year.	Ongoing	The City did not receive any requests for assistance associated with the rehabilitation and/or adaptive reuse of historic residences during the evaluation period. The City provides \$50,000 in CDBG funds for a minor home repair program through Habitat for Humanity for a maximum of \$5,000 per household. However, none of the ERAP addresses assisted were located in the Historic District.
HE Program 6.6 HOUSING CONDITIONS SURVEY / REHABILITATION & DEMOLITION STUDY	Complete survey by the end of calendar year 2020.	2020	Completed in 2020. No changes in 2023.
HE Program 7.1 FAIR HOUSING	Maintain and update educational materials on the City website, and conduct one to two comparative rental tests per year based on need and available financing.	Ongoing	The City maintains its association with NGO partners in responding to housing discrimination complaints and contracts with an agency that performs side by side tenant lease tests to surface discrimination by leasing agents. The City has contracted together with Fair Housing Council of Central California to conduct fair housing training, surveys, and testing. Educational materials are posted on the City website https://www.visalia.city/depts/finance/housing_n_cdbg_services/fair_housing_protection/default.asp .
HE Programs 8.1 ENERGY & WATER CONSERVATION PROGRAM	Maintain and update educational materials on the City website.	Ongoing	Educational materials are posted on the City's websites: https://www.visalia.city/depts/administration/water_conservation/cal_water/default.asp https://www.visalia.city/depts/public_works/natural_resource_conservation/renewable_energy_n_conservation/resources_n_incentives.asp
HE Program 9.1 IMPLEMENTATION REPORTING	Provide an Annual Progress Report to State HCD every year during the course of the reporting period.	Annually	The City has prepared and submitted the Annual Housing Report to State HCD, each year between 2015 and 2022, and the State has acknowledged receipt of the report. The 2023 Annual Progress Report will be presented to the City Council on March 18, 2024 and sent to HCD by March 31, 2024.
HE Program 9.2 PROGRESS MEETING	Convene annual meeting to review the Housing Element implementation progress.	Annually	Meetings to review and assess Housing Element Implementation Progress were done sporadically through 2023.
HE Program 9.3 MONITOR THE RHNA LAND INVENTORY	Report annually on maintenance and status of the RHNA Land Inventory, and ensure that no net loss of RHNA medium and high development density sites.	On a project basis as needed, and annually	The City has provided annual reports on the status of the RHNA sites inventory as part of the City's preparation and submittal of the Annual Progress Report. A sufficient balance of all income categories continues to exist. There was no loss of land designated for these categories in 2023. Specifically there were no General Plan Amendment nor Change of Zone entitlements processed in 2023 resulting in a reduction of land designations for these income categories.
HE Program 9.4 MONITOR CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT (CUP) REQUIREMENT IMPACTS ON AFFORDABLE HOUSING	Report annually to the Planning Commission on the effect of CUP requirements compared with comparable "permitted by right" projects, and ensure that CUP processing and conditions do not adversely impact the project's affordability.	On a project basis as needed, and annually	A report for the 2023 year is anticipated to be presented to the Commission in April 2024.

Jurisdiction	Visalia	
Reporting Period	2023	(Jan. 1 - Dec. 31)
Planning Period	5th Cycle	12/31/2015 - 12/31/2023

ANNUAL ELEMENT PROGRESS REPORT Housing Element Implementation

Note: "+" indicates an optional field

Cells in grey contain auto-calculation formulas

Table F

Units Rehabilitated, Preserved and Acquired for Alternative Adequate Sites pursuant to Government Code section 65583.1(c)

Please note this table is optional: The jurisdiction can use this table to report units that have been substantially rehabilitated, converted from non-affordable to affordable by acquisition, and preserved, including mobilehome park preservation, consistent with the standards set forth in Government Code section 65583.1, subdivision (c). Please note, motel, hotel, hostel rooms or other structures that are converted from non-residential to residential units pursuant to Government Code section 65583.1(c)(1)(D) are considered net-new housing units and must be reported in Table A2 and not reported in Table F.

Activity Type	Units that Do Not Count Towards RHNA ⁺ Listed for Informational Purposes Only				Units that Count Towards RHNA ⁺ Note - Because the statutory requirements severely limit what can be counted, please contact HCD at apr@hcd.ca.gov and we will unlock the form which enable you to populate these fields.				The description should adequately document how each unit complies with subsection (c) of Government Code Section 65583.1 ⁺ . For detailed reporting requirements, see the checklist here: https://www.hcd.ca.gov/community-development/docs/adequate-sites-checklist.pdf
	Extremely Low-Income ⁺	Very Low-Income ⁺	Low-Income ⁺	TOTAL UNITS ⁺	Extremely Low-Income ⁺	Very Low-Income ⁺	Low-Income ⁺	TOTAL UNITS ⁺	
Rehabilitation Activity									
Preservation of Units At-Risk									
Acquisition of Units									
Mobilehome Park Preservation									
Total Units by Income									

Jurisdiction	Visalia
Reporting Period	2023 (Jan. 1 - Dec. 31)
Planning Period	5th Cycle 12/31/2016 - 12/31/2023

ANNUAL ELEMENT PROGRESS REPORT

**Table K
Tenant Preference Policy**

Local governments are required to inform HCD about any local tenant preference ordinance the local government maintains when the jurisdiction submits their annual progress report on housing approvals and production, per Government Code 7061 (SB 649, 2022, Cortese). Effective January 1, 2023, local governments adopting a tenant preference are required to create a webpage on their internet website containing authorizing local ordinance and supporting materials, no more than 90 days after the ordinance becomes operational.

Does the Jurisdiction have a local tenant preference policy?	No
If the Jurisdiction has a local tenant preference policy, provide a link to the jurisdiction's webpage on their internet website containing authorizing local ordinance and supporting materials.	
Notes	

Jurisdiction	Visalia	
Reporting Year	2023	(Jan. 1 - Dec. 31)
Housing Element Planning Period	5th Cycle	12/31/2015 - 12/31/2023

Building Permits Issued by Affordability Summary		
Income Level		Current Year
Very Low	Deed Restricted	0
	Non-Deed Restricted	14
Low	Deed Restricted	0
	Non-Deed Restricted	16
Moderate	Deed Restricted	0
	Non-Deed Restricted	156
Above Moderate		165
Total Units		351

Note: Units serving extremely low-income households are included in the very low-income permitted units totals

Units by Structure Type	Entitled	Permitted	Completed
Single-family Attached	4	0	0
Single-family Detached	1578	316	449
2 to 4 units per structure	26	2	120
5+ units per structure	1160	12	172
Accessory Dwelling Unit	0	21	20
Mobile/Manufactured Home	0	0	0
Total	2768	351	761

Infill Housing Developments and Infill Units Permitted	# of Projects	Units
Indicated as Infill	213	225
Not Indicated as Infill	126	126

Housing Applications Summary	
Total Housing Applications Submitted:	16
Number of Proposed Units in All Applications Received:	1,878
Total Housing Units Approved:	1,878
Total Housing Units Disapproved:	0

Use of SB 35 Streamlining Provisions - Applications	
Number of SB 35 Streamlining Applications	0
Number of SB 35 Streamlining Applications Approved	0

Units Constructed - SB 35 Streamlining Permits			
Income	Rental	Ownership	Total
Very Low	0	0	0
Low	0	0	0

Moderate	0	0	0
Above Moderate	0	0	0
Total	0	0	0

Streamlining Provisions Used - Permitted Units	# of Projects	Units
SB 9 (2021) - Duplex in SF Zone	0	0
SB 9 (2021) - Residential Lot Split	1	2
AB 2011 (2022)	0	0
SB 6 (2022)	0	0
SB 35 (2017)	0	0

Ministerial and Discretionary Applications	# of Applications	Units
Ministerial	6	167
Discretionary	10	1745

Density Bonus Applications and Units Permitted	
Number of Applications Submitted Requesting a Density Bonus	0
Number of Units in Applications Submitted Requesting a Density Bonus	0
Number of Projects Permitted with a Density Bonus	0
Number of Units in Projects Permitted with a Density Bonus	0

Housing Element Programs Implemented and Sites Rezoned	Count
Programs Implemented	65
Sites Rezoned to Accommodate the RHNA	0