

# PLANNING COMMISSION AGENDA

Pending no technical difficulties, the Planning Commission meeting will be streamed via Facebook Live at <https://www.facebook.com/cityofvisalia/>

CHAIRPERSON:

Liz Wynn



VICE CHAIRPERSON:

Chris Gomez

COMMISSIONERS: Liz Wynn, Chris Gomez, Brett Taylor, Marvin Hansen, Sarrah Peariso

**MONDAY, APRIL 27, 2020 AT 6:00 P.M., COUNCIL CHAMBERS, 707 W. ACEQUIA, VISALIA CA**

1. THE PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE –

2. CITIZEN'S COMMENTS - This is the time for citizens to comment on subject matters that are not on the agenda but are within the jurisdiction of the Visalia Planning Commission. You may provide comments to the Planning Commission at this time, but the Planning Commission may only legally discuss those items already on tonight's agenda.

For those watching via the Facebook Live stream who want to provide citizen comments, please begin your comment with, "Citizen Comment" so that we understand it is a comment that you wish to be shared with the Planning Commission and is a comment that you would share publicly if you were attending the meeting in-person.

The Commission requests that a five (5) minute time limit be observed for Citizen Comments. You will be notified when your five minutes have expired.

3. PUBLIC COMMENT – To be sure that your comments are received, we strongly encourage citizens to submit public comment, or comment on a specific agenda item, before the meeting via email to [Susan.Currier@visalia.city](mailto:Susan.Currier@visalia.city). All emailed public comments will be distributed to the Planning Commission prior to the start of the meeting and incorporated into the official record.

Opportunity to comment is planned to be available on the Facebook livestream, but cannot be guaranteed to be available. In the event it is necessary, phone access may be provided at (559) 713-4165. However, this line will only be available if comments cannot be accepted via Facebook.

The public may present comments to the Planning Commission at the Council Chambers during the meeting, but physical attendance at the Council Chambers is strongly discouraged pursuant to the Governor's Executive Orders and public health guidance during the COVID-19 situation, and social distancing will be enforced. (The Planning Commission will NOT be present in the Council Chambers.)

4. CHANGES OR COMMENTS TO THE AGENDA –



5. CONSENT CALENDAR - All items under the consent calendar are to be considered routine and will be enacted by one motion. For any discussion of an item on the consent calendar, it will be removed at the request of the Commission and made a part of the regular agenda.
  - Time Extension for Maddox at Caldwell VII Tentative Subdivision Map No. 5531 and Conditional Use Permit No. 2007-09.
  - Time Extension for The Grove Tentative Subdivision Map No. 5562 and Conditional Use Permit No. 2017-15
6. PUBLIC HEARING – Cristobal Carrillo  
 Conditional Use Permit No. 2020-06: A request by Jessica Griffeth to establish a day spa within the O-PA (Professional/Administrative Office) Zone. The site is located at 1926 S. Court Street (APN: 097-281-077). The project is Categorically Exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) pursuant to CEQA Guidelines Section 15301, Categorical Exemption No. 2019-82
7. PUBLIC HEARING – Josh Dan  
 Conditional Use Permit No. 2019-44: A request by Justin Cate of Simply Brewing Co. to operate a micro-brewery with tasting room and a removable stage for entertainment performances in the D-MU (Downtown Mixed Use) zone. The site is located at 609 E Main St. (APN: 094-235-021) The project is Categorically Exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) pursuant to CEQA Guidelines Section 15301, Categorical Exemption No. 2020-09
8. CITY PLANNER/ PLANNING COMMISSION DISCUSSION-
  - Presentation of the 2019 Housing Element Annual Progress Report (APR) and Program Reporting.
  - Next Planning Commission Meeting May 11, 2020.
  - Reappointment of Commissioners Hansen and Wynn.

The Planning Commission meeting may end no later than 11:00 P.M. Any unfinished business may be continued to a future date and time to be determined by the Commission at this meeting. The Planning Commission routinely visits the project sites listed on the agenda.

For Hearing Impaired – Call (559) 713-4900 (TTY) 48-hours in advance of the scheduled meeting time to request signing services.

Any written materials relating to an item on this agenda submitted to the Planning Commission after distribution of the agenda packet are available for public inspection in the City Office, 315 E. Acequia Visalia, CA 93291, during normal business hours.

**APPEAL PROCEDURE**

**THE LAST DAY TO FILE AN APPEAL IS THURSDAY, MAY 7, 2020 BEFORE 5 PM**

According to the City of Visalia Zoning Ordinance Section 17.02.145 and Subdivision Ordinance Section 16.04.040, an appeal to the City Council may be submitted within ten days following the date of a decision by the Planning Commission. An appeal form with applicable fees shall be filed with the City Clerk at 220 N. Santa Fe, Visalia, CA 93292. The appeal shall specify errors or abuses of discretion by the Planning Commission, or decisions not supported by the evidence in the record. The appeal form can be found on the city's website [www.visalia.city](http://www.visalia.city) or from the City Clerk.

**THE NEXT REGULAR MEETING WILL BE HELD ON MONDAY, MAY 11, 2020**

# City of Visalia



**To:** Planning Commission

**From:** Brandon Smith, Senior Planner  
Paul Bernal, City Planner

BSS

PB

**Date:** April 27, 2020

**Re:** Presentation of the 2019 Housing Element Annual Progress Report (APR) and Program Reporting

---

## **Staff Recommendation**

Staff recommends that the Planning Commission receive the 2019 Housing Element Annual Progress Report. This report has been accepted by the City Council on March 16, 2020, and submitted to the State Department of Housing and Community Development (HCD) in accordance with State law, prior to the April 1, 2020 deadline.

## **Summary**

Pursuant to State Housing Law (Government Code Section §65400), cities and counties are required to report their progress on implementing their current Housing Elements. The report includes a summary of the jurisdiction's housing activity, progress in reaching their Regional Housing Needs Assessment (RHNA) assessment by income level, and progress in implementing its Housing Element's goals and programs. The report is a useful tool for City officials, staff, citizens, and stakeholder groups interested in the City's housing trends, particularly as they relate to affordable housing.

The report demonstrates that the City is in compliance with all applicable State laws and policies pertaining to housing, and that the City is implementing its housing policies and programs as articulated in its 5<sup>th</sup> Cycle Housing Element adopted in 2016. This report reviews the current status of programs from the 2016 Update rather than the recently approved 2019 Update, since the former was in effect for most of the 2019 calendar year.

## **Background Discussion**

The 2019 APR forms and tables are largely unchanged from the previous year's format. The APR continues to require reporting of all "considered" housing projects (i.e. potential projects submitted to the Site Plan Review Committee) as well as completed entitlements or permits for each individual housing unit, including those within the Above Moderate income level. Jurisdictions report these units to gain credit against their RHNA housing unit requirements.

All residential building permits must be tracked through to their final grant of occupancy. Only units that receive occupancy during the 2019 calendar year reporting period are counted toward the jurisdiction's RHNA allocation. Notwithstanding the interest in the jurisdiction's performance on providing affordable housing to lower income households, the APR requires detailed permit information on all residential units.



The contents of the APR are described below along with their applicability to the City of Visalia.

	<b>Table Name</b>	<b>Notes</b>
Table A	Housing development applications submitted	Lists all applications received <u>and</u> deemed complete in 2019. This entails Site Plan Review applications receiving a "Revise & Proceed" and follow-up entitlements if necessary.
Table A2	Annual building activity report summary	Lists all issued entitlements (i.e. SPR, CUP), issued building permits, and certificates of occupancy in 2019.
Table B	RHNA Progress	Summary of permits issued by income level in each year of RHNA allocation.
Table C	Sites identified / rezoned to accommodate shortfall housing need	N/A for Visalia. The City maintains a surplus in all levels.
Table D	Program implementation status	Reports on all 5 <sup>th</sup> Cycle Housing Element programs.
Table E	Commercial development bonuses approved	N/A for Visalia. No such applications received in reporting period
Table F	Units rehabilitated, preserved and acquired for alternative adequate sites	N/A for Visalia. Optional table.
Table G	Locally owned lands included in Housing Element sites inventory that have been sold, leased, or disposed	N/A for Visalia.
Summary	Summary of data from preceding tables	Summary of data from preceding tables.

Comparative data sets between the 2018 and 2019 APR submittals are shown in the tables below:

<b>Building Permits by Residential Type</b>	<b>2018</b>	<b>2019</b>
# units in permits issued for Accessory Dwellings	2	4
# units in permits issued for Single-Family Dwellings	504	633
# units in permits issued for Multi-Family Dwellings	74	61
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>580</b>	<b>698</b>
# units granted occupancy for Accessory Dwellings	1	1
# units granted occupancy for Single-Family Dwellings	480	529
# units granted occupancy for Multi-Family Dwellings	38	72
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>519</b>	<b>703</b>

<b>Issued Building Permits by Affordability Level</b>	<b>2018</b>	<b>2019</b>
Above Moderate (>120% AMI)	391	169
Moderate (80 - 120% AMI)	102	463
Low (50 - 80% AMI)	87	46
Very Low (30 - 50% AMI)	0	20
Extremely Low (<30% AMI)	0	0
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>580</b>	<b>698</b>



The following points provide further summarize information contained in the report:

- The 61 multi-family units that were issued permits are all classified as affordable to lower income categories (Very Low and Low) based on the projects' underlying zone density. None of these units are deed restricted or benefit from participation in the City's affordable housing incentives and concessions provisions (Zoning Ordinance Section 17.32.170 et. seq.).
- A total of two single-family residences and three accessory dwelling units were issued permits and are classified as affordable to lower income (Very Low, and Low) categories based on total valuation of the permit and number of bedrooms.
- A total of 463 single-family residences are classified as affordable to the Moderate Income category, and 169 single-family residences are classified as affordable to the Above Moderate Income category, based on total valuation of the permit and number of bedrooms.
- It should be noted that for the 2019 year, staff utilized a different method of calculating mortgage affordability. For 2019 affordability was determined based on an affordability calculator made available by State HCD through their website, whereas for 2018 staff utilized an affordability calculator with different input values recommended by a local mortgage lender. The change in this year's reporting resulted in raising the threshold for Above Moderate income households, resulting in significantly more households being affordable to Moderate income households.
- Applications reflecting a total of 136 units have been submitted and deemed complete in 2019. This number is comprised of all applications that have been formally submitted and determined complete. This can include Site Plan Review applications for by-right uses receiving a "Revise & Proceed" as well as entitlements (e.g. Tentative Subdivision Maps, and Tentative Parcel Maps). The number is significantly lower this year than in past years due to only one subdivision completed this year (the 34-unit Walnut Park Estates Tentative Subdivision Map).

### **Regional Housing Needs Assessment (RHNA) Compliance**

There were no discretionary actions that affected the City's RHNA obligations. Consequently, the RHNA remains in compliance with the Housing Element and State law.

## **Annual Report on Conditional Use Permit Process for Multi-Family Projects**

Program 1.4 in the Housing Element states requires that the City annually assess the Conditional Use Permit (CUP) process for multi-family residential projects greater than 80 housing units to ensure that the entitlement process does not adversely impact the timing, cost, or supply of multi-family development. Such assessment shall be provided to the Planning Commission.

In the 2019 calendar year, the Planning Commission considered one CUP for a multi-family project greater than 80 units:

- Conditional Use Permit No. 2019-40: A request by Self-Help Enterprises to develop a mixed-use project consisting of an 81-unit multi-family component. The project included seven artist live/work lofts, 73 one and two-bedroom units made affordable to Low Income households with up to 30% of the units reserved for supportive housing, and one manager's unit. The site is located in the Downtown Mixed Use zone district, on the north side of Oak Avenue between Garden and Bridge Streets. (APN: 094-283-001). The Planning Commission considered and approved this CUP on December 9, 2019.

For the above project, a Conditional Use Permit is required for any residential development located within a non-residential zone district. Housing Element Program 2.6, to be fulfilled by year 2021, would process a Zoning Text Amendment to make residential a by-right use in the Mixed Use zone district, provided that the project is able to meet performance standards (performance standards would be drafted as part of the Amendment). With regards to timing, this project was received on October 18, deemed complete on October 29, and received a public hearing on December 9 (52 days from receipt), which is less than the estimated 2 to 3 month total processing time for this project as indicated in Housing Element Table 1-51. Additionally, the CUP process and the associated cost was not considered a deterrent to the number of units associated with the project since the applicant was able to achieve the desired unit count and product type associated with their application.

## **Annual Report on CUP Requirement Impacts on Affordable Housing**

Program 9.4 in the 2019 Housing Element states requires that the City monitor every proposed development on RHNA land inventory sites to ensure that the effects of processing a CUP, when required, does not unreasonably delay entitlement processing, increase development costs in a manner that eliminates potential affordability, or affect potential development density. The City must annually report to the Planning Commission the effect of CUP requirements compared with comparable "permitted by right" projects. This is to ensure that the CUP processing and conditions do no adversely affect the project's affordability.

In the 2019 calendar year the City processed one CUP on a RHNA land inventory site – the Old Lumberyard site – which was the location of CUP 2019-40 described above. The site was inventoried in the 2016 Housing Element for 60 units serving Low Income households, and the CUP approved 80 deed-restricted Low Income units on the site plus a manager's unit. As stated in the analysis for Program 1.4, this project's entitlement



timeframe, cost, and density were not adversely affected by the CUP process. No comparable permitted by-right project could be found for this project based on several unique attributes of the project (i.e. mixed-use, commercial zoning, unit count, deed restriction). The project's CUP requires the project to conform to the applicant's submitted site plan, elevations, and operational statement, and comply with conditions associated with the site's commissioned historic review, all of which the applicant consented to. Otherwise, the CUP does not impose any conditions beyond the development standards contained in the Zoning Ordinance.

### **Annual Report on Incentives for Infill Affordable Housing**

Program 2.5 in the 2019 Housing Element requires that the City annually report to the Planning Commission projects that meet the threshold criteria and take advantage of the Affordable Housing Infill Incentive Program. This program reduces Transportation Impact Fees up to 60% of the base fee for residential projects in qualifying infill sites. This program became effective November 16, 2017, in fulfillment of a previously-established Housing Element Program.

In the calendar year 2019, there were no projects that were issued building permits and took advantage of this Program.

### **Attachments**

- 2019 Annual Progress Report

Jurisdiction	Visalia	
Reporting Year	2019	(Jan. 1 - Dec. 31)

Building Permits Issued by Affordability Summary		
Income Level		Current Year
Very Low	Deed Restricted	24
	Non-Deed Restricted	0
Low	Deed Restricted	61
	Non-Deed Restricted	126
Moderate	Deed Restricted	0
	Non-Deed Restricted	242
Above Moderate		489
Total Units		942

Note: Units serving extremely low-income households are included in the very low-income permitted units totals

Housing Applications Summary	
Total Housing Applications Submitted:	0
Number of Proposed Units in All Applications Received:	136
Total Housing Units Approved:	136
Total Housing Units Disapproved:	0

Use of SB 35 Streamlining Provisions	
Number of Applications for Streamlining	0
Number of Streamlining Applications Approved	0
Total Developments Approved with Streamlining	0
Total Units Constructed with Streamlining	0

Units Constructed - SB 35 Streamlining Permits			
Income	Rental	Ownership	Total
Very Low	0	0	0
Low	0	0	0
Moderate	0	0	0
Above Moderate	0	0	0
Total	0	0	0

Cells in grey contain auto-calculation formulas









Appendix B - Environmental Assessment Report

Page 10 of 10

Table 10 - Summary of Environmental Assessment Report

Item	Location	Assessment Method	Assessment Results	Assessment Date
1	...	...	...	...
2	...	...	...	...
3	...	...	...	...
4	...	...	...	...
5	...	...	...	...
6	...	...	...	...
7	...	...	...	...
8	...	...	...	...
9	...	...	...	...
10	...	...	...	...
11	...	...	...	...
12	...	...	...	...
13	...	...	...	...
14	...	...	...	...
15	...	...	...	...
16	...	...	...	...
17	...	...	...	...
18	...	...	...	...
19	...	...	...	...
20	...	...	...	...
21	...	...	...	...
22	...	...	...	...
23	...	...	...	...
24	...	...	...	...
25	...	...	...	...
26	...	...	...	...
27	...	...	...	...
28	...	...	...	...
29	...	...	...	...
30	...	...	...	...
31	...	...	...	...
32	...	...	...	...
33	...	...	...	...
34	...	...	...	...
35	...	...	...	...
36	...	...	...	...
37	...	...	...	...
38	...	...	...	...
39	...	...	...	...
40	...	...	...	...
41	...	...	...	...
42	...	...	...	...
43	...	...	...	...
44	...	...	...	...
45	...	...	...	...
46	...	...	...	...
47	...	...	...	...
48	...	...	...	...
49	...	...	...	...
50	...	...	...	...
51	...	...	...	...
52	...	...	...	...
53	...	...	...	...
54	...	...	...	...
55	...	...	...	...
56	...	...	...	...
57	...	...	...	...
58	...	...	...	...
59	...	...	...	...
60	...	...	...	...
61	...	...	...	...
62	...	...	...	...
63	...	...	...	...
64	...	...	...	...
65	...	...	...	...
66	...	...	...	...
67	...	...	...	...
68	...	...	...	...
69	...	...	...	...
70	...	...	...	...
71	...	...	...	...
72	...	...	...	...
73	...	...	...	...
74	...	...	...	...
75	...	...	...	...
76	...	...	...	...
77	...	...	...	...
78	...	...	...	...
79	...	...	...	...
80	...	...	...	...
81	...	...	...	...
82	...	...	...	...
83	...	...	...	...
84	...	...	...	...
85	...	...	...	...
86	...	...	...	...
87	...	...	...	...
88	...	...	...	...
89	...	...	...	...
90	...	...	...	...
91	...	...	...	...
92	...	...	...	...
93	...	...	...	...
94	...	...	...	...
95	...	...	...	...
96	...	...	...	...
97	...	...	...	...
98	...	...	...	...
99	...	...	...	...
100	...	...	...	...













Jurisdiction	Visalia
Reporting Year	2019 (Jan. 1 - Dec. 31)

**ANNUAL ELEMENT PROGRESS REPORT**  
**Housing Element Implementation**  
 (CCR Title 25 §6202)

This table is auto-populated once you enter your jurisdiction name and current year data. Past year information comes from previous APRs. Please contact HCD if your data is different than the material supplied here

**Table B**

**Regional Housing Needs Allocation Progress**  
**Permitted Units Issued by Affordability**

Income Level	RHNA Allocation by Income Level	Permitted Units Issued by Affordability										Total Units to Date (all years)	Total Remaining RHNA by Income Level		
		2015	2016	2017	2018	2019	2020	2021	2022	2023	2024				
Very Low	2010	9	36	2										109	2507
	Non-Deed Restricted		42												
Low	1031	106		72	1									420	1602
	Non-Deed Restricted		118		86										
Moderate	1002	132	270	20	102									1005	797
	Non-Deed Restricted	367	248	403	391	169								1576	2098
<b>Total RHNA</b>	<b>10021</b>	<b>614</b>	<b>721</b>	<b>506</b>	<b>580</b>	<b>698</b>	<b>698</b>	<b>580</b>	<b>506</b>	<b>721</b>	<b>698</b>	<b>580</b>	<b>506</b>	<b>3119</b>	<b>6902</b>
<b>Total Units</b>															

Note: units serving extremely low-income households are included in the very low-income permitted units totals. Cells in grey contain auto-calculation formulas



# ANNUAL ELEMENT PROGRESS REPORT

## Housing Element Implementation

(CCR Title 25 §6202)

<b>Jurisdiction</b>	Visalia
<b>Reporting Year</b>	2019

Table D

### Program Implementation Status pursuant to GC Section 65583

Housing Programs Progress Report			
1	2	3	4
Name of Program	Objective	Timeframe in H.E.	Status of Program Implementation
Describe progress of all programs including local efforts to remove governmental constraints to the maintenance, improvement, and development of housing as identified in the housing element.			
HE Program 1.1 DESIGNATE FOR SUFFICIENT LAND	No net loss of land designated for Median, Low, Very Low, and Extremely Low Income Categories	Review annually	Review completed as part of Annual Progress Report, concluding that sufficient balance of all income categories exist. The 2019 four-year update of the Housing Element resulted in additional median income designated land.
HE Program 1.2 CONTACT WITH CITY OFFICIALS	Conduct one discussion session by the Building Advisory Committee (BAC) quarterly meeting, and report back to the Committee on any issues raised within two CRC Quarterly meetings.	Annually	There were three meetings of the Building Advisory Committee held in 2019. Nodiscussion was voiced by members or attendees regarding specific controls or building standards that would discourage affordable or multi-family housing.
HE Program 1.3 HIGH DENSITY MULTIPLE- FAMILY DEVELOPMENTS BY RIGHT	Complete Ordinance Amendment within one year of Housing Element certification	2016/17	The City adopted this revision by Zoning Text Amendment No. 2017-02 (Ordinance No. 2017-19) on December 18, 2017. To date, there have been no developments in the range of 61 to 80 units that have been able to take advantage of the revision.
HE Program 1.4 CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT PROCESS	Complete Ordinance Amendment within one year of Housing Element certification	Annually	The City adopted a Zoning Text Amendment on December 18, 2017 to allow multi-family projects up to 80 units as a by-right use. The City has since monitored conditional use permit applications for multi-family residential development and has not found the CUP process to negatively impact the development of multi-family housing.
HE Program 1.5 HOUSING EDUCATION	Schedule, coordinate and conduct at least one subject public meeting or stakeholder group seminar per year	Annually	As part of the update of the City's Consolidated Plan and Analysis of Impediments to Fair Housing documents, extensive outreach was conducted in 2019 which included public meetings and education to the community on affordable housing needs and fair housing issues.

HE Program 1.6 PROJECT STATUS REPORT	Meet all prescribed processing timelines as contained in the City's Zoning Code and Community Development Department policies and procedures. Establish a tracking system for length of time taken to process entitlement requests, and include the summary results in the Annual Report.	Daily, Report Annually	All processing timelines monitored. The Annual Report of the Planning Commission for 2018 was presented to City Council on February 19, 2019, and the Annual Report of the Planning Commission for 2019 was presented to City Council on February 18, 2020.
HE Program 1.7 INCREASE HEIGHT IN R-M-3 ZONE	Adopt implementing Ordinance within one year of Housing Element Update certification	2016/17	The City adopted this revision by Zoning Text Amendment No. 2017-02 (Ordinance No. 2017-19) on December 18, 2017. To date, there have been no four-story developments that have been able to take advantage of the revision.
HE Program 2.1 INFILL SITE INVENTORY	Inventory document placed at Community Development front counter prior to the end of calendar year 2017.	FY 2016/17, and Review annually	An update of the infill site inventory was completed as part of the 5th cycle housing element four-year update, made available to the public in October 2019.
HE Program 2.2 INCENTIVES FOR DOWNTOWN HOUSING	Five units of residential converted from commercial space, or one new multi-family residential project per year.	Ongoing	In 2019 two Conditional Use Permits for downtown housing projects were approved: an 81-unit affordable housing / mixed-use complex and a 1-unit addition to previously approved mixed-use project.
HE Program 2.3 INFRASTRUCTURE FUNDING PROGRAM	Apply for at least one qualifying grant	Annually	Approximately 25 grants for infrastructure improvements were being managed by the City in May 2019. Many grants pertain to road rehabilitation citywide and Class I multi-use trail construction for the City's active transportation network that interconnects to Downtown and East Downtown. Individual grants include design and right-of-way acquisition of the Santa Fe roundabout benefiting East Downtown and a sustainable communities grant to examine ways to enhance and protect non-vehicular circulation in the Downtown and East Downtown areas, including better sidewalk connections and pedestrian crossings.
HE Program 2.4 MIXED USE DEVELOPMENT	At least one qualifying project per year	Ongoing	In 2019 two Conditional Use Permits for mixed-use housing projects were approved: a new 81-unit affordable housing complex at 300 E. Oak Avenue and a 1-unit addition to previously approved project at 117 E. Main Street.
HE Program 2.5 INCENTIVES FOR INFILL AFFORDABLE HOUSING	Adopt implementing Resolution within one year of Housing Element Update certification	Within one year of Housing Element Update certification	The City adopted this revision by Zoning Text Amendment No. 2017-02 (Ordinance No. 2017-19) on December 18, 2017. To date, there have been no developments that have met the requirements of the fee reduction.
HE Program 3.1 LEGISLATIVE RELIEF	N/A	Ongoing	In 2019 the City sent a letter in opposition of AB 725.
HE Program 3.2 MULTIPLE-FAMILY DEVELOPMENTS	Develop 500 multi-family units (25 extremely low, 50 very low, 75 low, and 100 moderate, and 250 above moderate) during the first five years of the program	Annually	In 2019 the City issued permits for 61 multi-family units for a total of 441 units in the five-year period between 2015 and 2019.



HE Program 3.3 FIRST-TIME HOMEBUYER PROGRAM	Assist 50 low- and moderate-income first-time homebuyers over the next five years.	Ongoing	Completed three (3) down payment CalHome Reuse loans during 2019.
HE Program 3.4 MORTGAGE REVENUE BONDS, MORTGAGE CREDIT CERTIFICATES, LOW INCOME TAX CREDITS	Provide technical assistance for the issuance of one mortgage revenue bond, mortgage credit certificate, or low income tax credit funded project.	Ongoing	No tax credit projects submitted in 2019
HE Program 3.5 FHA/HUD/HCD AND FEDERAL HOUSING TRUST PROGRAMS OR AVAILABLE GOVERNMENT FUNDING	Sponsor one seminar per year to facilitate promotion of this program	FY 2016/2017 and ongoing	No seminar conducted. No new programs or grant funds related to affordable housing during 2019.
HE Program 3.6 SECTION 8 HOUSING ASSISTANCE PROGRAM	Assist 550 lower income families with rental housing assistance annually.	Ongoing	TCHA receives and oversees 2,841 Section 8 funding/vouchers within Visalia. The City does not receive Section 8 vouchers- Code Enforcement works with TCHA as needed.
HE Program 3.7 INFORM PUBLIC OF LOCAL, STATE, AND FEDERAL HOUSING PROGRAMS	Distribute 500 brochures or conduct 3 public outreach meetings annually	Annually and ongoing	CalHome Reuse Program included on the City's website and interested applicants, realtors and lenders directed to the City's Contracted Service provider (throughout 2019)
HE Program 3.8 LOAN PROGRAM EDUCATION	Sponsor 4 quarterly meetings to educate realtors, home buyers, and others to facilitate promotion of this program	Ongoing	Online (City website)- CalHome Reuse Lender and Realtor certification. CalHome Reuse continues to be administered by SHE in 2019.
HE Program 3.9 AGENCY COORDINATION	Conduct at least one outreach annually	FY 2016/2017 and ongoing	Educate interested buyers about the CalHome Reuse program- See City website for fact sheet regarding CalHome Reuse.
HE Program 3.10 AVAILABILITY OF FUNDING INCLUDING LAND WRITE-DOWN PROGRAMS	Complete ten applications under this program per year.	Ongoing	City receives annual CDBG and HOME funding from HUD. See 2019 Action Plan.
HE Program 3.11 CITY INCENTIVE FOR AFFORDABLE HOUSING	Provide one such program per year.	Ongoing	The City adopted one program: a Traffic Impact Fee Reduction program by Zoning Text Amendment No. 2017-02 (Ordinance No. 2017-19) on December 18, 2017. In addition, a forgivable loan was utilized in 2019 for the sale of land to be developed with deed-restricted affordable housing.

HE Program 3.12 DEVELOPMENT FEE REDUCTION/DEFERMENT	Complete the Study and present to City Council for final consideration	2017/18	Incentives are contained in Zoning Ordinance and Housing policy documents 5-Year and Annual Plan and reported in CAPER
HE Program 3.13 SWEAT EQUITY PROGRAM	Assist 50 first-time lower income home buyers over the next five years to purchase a home	Ongoing	No funding or program currently available.(2019)
HE Program 3.14 LAND BANKING	Participate in at least one land banking project during the current reporting period.	2016/17	Not presently applicable. The City does not use funding to landbank. The City however, does have one surplus lot that is in agreement to sell to Self Help Enterprises for the development of a mixed-use affordable housing project.
HE Program 3.15 PROMOTING SECOND DWELLING UNITS	Permit the establishment of a minimum of five units per year.	2016/17 and ongoing	The City issued permits for five accessory dwelling units in 2019.
HE Program 3.16 ASSISTED HOUSING PROJECTS ELIGIBLE FOR CONVERSION	Achieve 100% contact with all subject at-risk property owners one year before contract expiration.	Annually	The City has continued to monitor properties on an annual basis and has not found any properties at-risk of converting to market rate within a five year time frame.
HE Program 3.17 PLANNING FOR LARGE SITES	Entitle a minimum of one master planned project on a RHNA listed site per year.	Annually and ongoing	Building permits issued or under review in 2019 for the three large MFR (over 100 units) projects entitled in between 2013 and 2017 (Diamond Oaks, Country Club Apts, and Shirk-Doe).
HE Program 3.18 TARGETING EXTREMELY- LOW INCOME DEVELOPMENTS	50 extremely low-income units within five years	Ongoing	Projects continue to be researched for opportunities to develop and acquire/rehab rental units.
HE Program 3.19 ENCOURAGE NEW MOBILE HOME PARKS	Adopt enabling ordinance within one year of Housing Element certification.	Within one year of Housing Element certification	The City adopted this revision by Zoning Text Amendment No. 2017-02 (Ordinance No. 2017-19) on December 18, 2017. No new mobile home parks have been approved or constructed during the review period.
HE Program 3.20 PROVIDE PRIORITY SEWER SERVICE FOR AFFORDABLE HOUSING PROJECTS	Identify all projects meeting the criteria for affordable housing and ensure their first priority status to connect to the City sanitary sewer system.	Ongoing	Capacity and infrastructure are sufficient for all anticipated growth, including affordable housing.
HE Program 4.1 HOMEBUYER EDUCATION PROGRAM OUTREACH	Participate in at least one education seminar per year.	Ongoing	The City has contracted with Self-Help Enterprises for counseling services as needed. Service provider information is posted on the City website: <a href="https://www.visalia.city/depts/community_development/housing_n_cdbg_services/affordable_housing.asp">https://www.visalia.city/depts/community_development/housing_n_cdbg_services/affordable_housing.asp</a> . The City has required all homebuyers to participate in homebuyer education, serviced by Self Help Enterprises. Self Help Enterprises leads the seminar.



HE Program 4.2 FORECLOSURE PREVENTION RESOURCES	Verify that the correct and up to date information is posted to City website, and updated on at least an annual basis.	Ongoing	Fair housing information is posted on the City website: <a href="https://www.visalia.city/depts/finance/housing_n_cdbg_services/fair_housing_protection/default.asp">https://www.visalia.city/depts/finance/housing_n_cdbg_services/fair_housing_protection/default.asp</a> , including contact information for HUD's certified counselors. In the past, the City has referred people to C-SET for services.
HE Program 4.3 NUISANCE ABATEMENT IN IMPACTED NEIGHBORHOODS	Secure properties subject to the emergency nuisance abatement within 72 hours of appraisal, and establish a tracking system for managing nuisance abatement cases and report activity in the Annual Report.	Ongoing	Since 2015 the City continues to abate and track properties. The City's goal has been to secure properties within 24 hours of appraisal, well in excess of the 72 hour objective.
HE Program 4.4 FORECLOSURE ACQUISITION	Acquire a minimum of 5 units per year. Include acquisition activity in the Annual Report.	Ongoing	In 2019 the City did not acquire any foreclosed properties since it did not have NSP program funding for this program.
HE Program 5.1 LEGISLATIVE AWARENESS	Participate in at least two legislative initiatives per year.	Ongoing	In 2019 the City sent a letter in opposition of AB 725.
HE Program 5.2 HOMELESS SHELTER PROGRAM	Assist 600 persons per year	Ongoing	The City contributes funding for rental assistance- Transitional Housing Program- (five participants), known as Tenant Based Rental Assistance Program. The City also provides matching funds for Case Management to non-profit agencies, who receive funding directly from U. S. Department of Housing and Urban Development through "The Alliance", Tulare –Kings Counties Continuum of Care. In 2019 the City continued to search for grant opportunities. The city did provide funding toward the acquisition of a 22-bed public facility at 1627 S. Garden Street for bridge housing to address homeless needs.
HE Program 5.3 REASONABLE ACCOMMODATION	Complete any initiated Municipal Code amendment required to address reasonable accommodation regulatory deficiencies within one year of certification of the Housing Element.	Within one year of certification of the Housing Element and Ongoing	The City adopted this revision by Zoning Text Amendment No. 2017-02 (Ordinance No. 2017-19) on December 18, 2017. To date, there have been no known instances where an entitlement for accommodation requirement was waived under the amendment.
HE Program 5.4 REASONABLE ACCOMMODATION	Post completed brochure at City offices and on City website	FY2016/17 and ongoing	The brochure is available at the front counter and has been posed on the City website <a href="https://www.visalia.city/depts/community_development/planning/gp.asp">https://www.visalia.city/depts/community_development/planning/gp.asp</a> . To date there have been no known requests by the public for reasonable accommodation.
HE Program 5.5 SENIOR RENTAL HOUSING	Facilitate the construction of at least 10 very low-income and 10 low-income senior units during the reporting period.	Ongoing	In 2019 the City issued permits for 40 low income non-deed restricted senior units. Also in 2019 the City has been in conversation with non-profit Kaweah Management Company to develop an entitled senior housing project as deed-restricted low income housing, and has recently provided assistance in preparation of a tax credit application.

HE Program 5.6 REHABILITATION ASSISTANCE FOR SENIOR & DISABLED HOMEOWNERS	Assist 180 qualifying persons and 600 repairs. Track assistance accomplishments and include in the Annual Report.	Ongoing	City assisted three (3) senior owned mobile home repairs in 2019.
HE Program 5.7 LARGE FAMILIES	Facilitate the construction of at least 16 units per year (8 very low- and 8 low-income units)	Ongoing	Generally half of the very low- and low-income dwelling units constructed in 2019 were units with three or more bedrooms, exceeding the City's quantified objective. Most of these were done without public funding assistance.
HE Program 5.8 HOUSING FOR PERSONS WITH DEVELOPMENTAL DISABILITIES	Facilitate the construction of at least five units per year during the current reporting period.	2017 and annually thereafter	No funding or program interest has been identified to City during this period. Group homes within dwelling units have been established by the private sector.
HE Program 5.9 FARMWORKER HOUSING	Zoning Ordinance Amendment adopted and in effect	Within one year of certification of the Housing Element	The City adopted this revision by Zoning Text Amendment No. 2017-02 (Ordinance No. 2017-19) on December 18, 2017. No farmworker or employee housing has been established in the City during this period.
HE Program 6.1 HOUSING REHABILITATION PROGRAM	Assist 25 low-income homeowners during the course of the current reporting period.	Ongoing	The City has committed funds annually to housing rehabilitation loans and reinvests loan repayments to additional house rehabilitation loans. Projects include the CHDO Scattered Site Acquisition / Rehabilitation program. No units acquired or rehabilitated during 2019
HE Program 6.2 LOW-INCOME RENTAL REHABILITATION PROGRAM	Assist 40 low-income homeowners with forgivable loans during the course of the current reporting period.	Ongoing	Self Help Enterprises provides rental rehabilitation, which the City supports through funding. The City has successfully partnered with Self Help Enterprises to rehabilitate rental units. No units acquired during 2019
HE Program 6.3 EMERGENCY REPAIRS PROGRAM	Assist 50 low-income homeowners during the course of the reporting period.	Ongoing	The City has sponsored the Emergency Repair & Accessible Program, though it has been unfunded between 2008 and 2018. In 2019 the City Council approved funding to initiate policy development and assistance in conjunction with other funding programs such as Senior Mobile Home Repair Grant funding.
HE Program 6.4 ENFORCEMENT OF HOUSING AND BUILDING CODES	Complete 50 residences inspections per year in response to substandard building or living condition referrals.	Ongoing	The City has directed substantial Neighborhood Preservation (i.e. code enforcement) resources to reducing neighborhood blight through active code compliance and enforcement actions that include administrative fines assessed on property owners found to be continuously out of compliance. This effort is funded by CDBG funds and is renewed annually due to its success. In 2019 Neighborhood Preservation inspected 215 properties for substandard complaints.
HE Program 6.5 REHABILITATION AND ADAPTIVE REUSE	Rehabilitate five units per year.	Ongoing	The City did not receive any requests for assistance associated with the rehabilitation and/or adaptive reuse of historic residences during the evaluation period.



HE Program 6.6 HOUSING CONDITIONS SURVEY / REHABILITATION & DEMOLITION STUDY	Secure grant funding by calendar year 2017, and complete survey by the end of calendar year 2018.	2017/18	The City contracted with a consultant to prepare the survey as part of the 2020 Consolidated Plan update. The survey was completed in mid-2019 and the City Council accepted the survey in August 2019.
HE Program 7.1 FAIR HOUSING	Post educational materials to City website, and conduct five comparative rental tests per year.	FY 2016/2017 and annually through the term of the Housing Element.	The City maintains its association with NGO partners in responding to housing discrimination complaints and contracts with an agency that performs side by side tenant lease tests to surface discrimination by leasing agents. The City has contracted together with Fair Housing Council of Central California to conduct fair housing training, surveys, and testing. Educational materials are posted on the City website <a href="https://www.visalia.city/depts/finance/housing_n_cdbg_services/fair_housing_protection/default.asp">https://www.visalia.city/depts/finance/housing_n_cdbg_services/fair_housing_protection/default.asp</a> .
HE Programs 8.1 ENERGY & WATER CONSERVATION PROGRAM	Refer 100 residents per year to available grants.	Ongoing	Information on the HERO Program is posted on the City's website: <a href="https://www.visalia.city/depts/administration/ed/incentives.asp">https://www.visalia.city/depts/administration/ed/incentives.asp</a> . Exact number of residents reached out through training and website is unknown. In May 2019 the City Council voted to discontinue the City's participation in the HERO Program.
HE Program 9.1 IMPLEMENTATION REPORTING	Provide an Annual Report to State HCD every year during the course of the reporting period.	2016/17, Annually	The City has prepared and submitted the Annual Housing Report to State HCD, each year between 2015 and 2018, and the State has acknowledged receipt of the report. The 2019 Annual Progress Report will be presented to the City Council on March 16, 2020 and sent to HCD before March 31, 2020.
HE Program 9.2 IMPLEMENTATION TRACKING MATRIX	Utilize the Implementation Tracking Matrix in the Annual Report every year during the course of the reporting period.	Biannually	The City has utilized an implementation tracking matrix in association with the preparation and submittal of the Annual Housing Report.
HE Program 9.3 PROGRESS MEETING	Convene bi-annual meeting to review the Housing Element implementation progress.	Biannually	The City uses the opportunity accorded by preparation of the Annual Progress Reports to annually evaluate the efficiency of the City's Housing programs.
HE Program 9.4 MONITOR THE RHNA LAND INVENTORY	Report annually on maintenance and status of the RHNA Land Inventory, and ensure that no net loss of RHNA medium and high development density sites.	On a project basis as needed, and semi-annually	The City has provided annual reports on the status of the RHNA sites inventory as part of the City's preparation and submittal of the Annual Progress Report. The City updated the Sites Inventory in 2019 as part of the four-year Housing Element Update. The passage of AB 1397 resulted in the removal of very low and low income site, but a surplus of sites remains for both income levels.
HE Program 9.5 MONITOR CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT (CUP) REQUIREMENT IMPACTS ON AFFORDABLE HOUSING	Report annually on the effect of CUP requirements compared with comparable "permitted by right" projects, and ensure that CUP processing and conditions do not adversely impact the project's affordability.	On a project basis as needed, and annually	Annual reports were prepared and findings were made that projects permitted by Conditional Use Permit were modestly conditioned relative to development costs and did not affect the overall development or affordability of the project.

HE Program 9.6 COMPREHENSIVE ANNUAL MONITORING PROGRAM	Include documentation of annual sales and rental rates in the Annual Report every year.	2016/17, Annually	The City uses the opportunity accorded by preparation of the Annual Progress Reports and the CAPER to annually evaluate the efficiency of the City's Housing programs. In addition the City conducts annual evaluations of existing home sales prices to compare to the established analysis by HUD.
HE Program 9.7 SUCCESSOR HOUSING AGENCY REPORTING PROGRAM	Provide a report on housing and financial activity information on an annual basis.	2016/17, Annually	The City has provided Annual Reports that specify housing and activity information pertaining to the successor housing agency.
HE Program 9.8 DISADVANTAGED UNINCORPORATED COMMUNITIES (DUC)	Land Use Policy and Program adopted. Annexation Survey prepared and delivered as established in the Program.	Adopt Land Use Policy and Program regarding DUC Annexation – Within one year of certification of the Housing Element Update. Ongoing Implementation- No less than Bi-Annually beginning in 2017	In 2018, the City initiated a project for the annexation of the balance of the K Road County Island, the City's only DUC. The City Council authorized the filing of an application and the Tulare County Local Agency Formation Commission approved the annexation in 2019. No significant objection was received. The annexation was completed in January 2020.
HE Program 9.9 CONDUCT A COMPREHENSIVE REVIEW OF THE GENERAL PLAN	Review and initiate any required General Plan Amendments for adoption by the Visalia City Council.	Within one year of certification of the Housing Element, and annually thereafter.	The City completed consistency between the Housing Element and the General Plan and Zoning Ordinance by adoption of revisions through General Plan Amendment No. 2017-01 (Resolution No. 2017-77) and Zoning Text Amendment No. 2017-02 (Ordinance No. 2017-19) on November 20, 2017 and December 18, 2017. A four-year Housing Element update completed in 2019 resulted in new planned Zoning Code Amendments to be completed in 2020.
HE Program 9.10 PROCESS ALL IDENTIFIED ZONING CODE AMENDMENTS CONTAINED IN THE HOUSING ELEMENT UPDATE	Zoning Text Amendments adopted by Ordinance within one year of certification of the Housing Element.	Within one year of certification of the Housing Element.	The City adopted this revision by Zoning Text Amendment No. 2017-02 (Ordinance No. 2017-19) on December 18, 2017. A four-year Housing Element update completed in 2019 resulted in new planned Zoning Code Amendments to be completed in 2020.
HE Program 9.11 LINK TRANSIT SERVICES AND FACILITIES WITH EXISTING AND PROPOSED RHNA LAND INVENTORY SITES	Active Transportation Plan and the Visalia Long Range Transit Plan include a map exhibit and policies as needed to implement the plan for optimal linkages with current high density residential nodes and RHNA Land Inventory sites to jobs, commerce, and services hubs.	With adoption of both the Active Transportation Plan and the Visalia Long Range Transit Plan, or within one year of certification of the Housing Element, whichever occurs first.	Map exhibits have been placed in the City's Active Transportation Plan and the Long Range Transit Plan that illustrate optimal linkages, defined by the locations of current high density residential nodes and RHNA land inventory sites to jobs, commerce, and service hubs.



