

# PLANNING COMMISSION AGENDA

CHAIRPERSON:

Brett Taylor



VICE CHAIRPERSON:

Liz Wynn

COMMISSIONERS: Brett Taylor, Liz Wynn, Chris Gomez, Marvin Hansen, Sarrah Peariso

**MONDAY, MARCH 12, 2018; 7:00 P.M., COUNCIL CHAMBERS, 707 W. ACEQUIA, VISALIA CA**

1. THE PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE –
2. CITIZEN'S COMMENTS – This is the time for citizens to comment on subject matters that are not on the agenda but are within the jurisdiction of the Visalia Planning Commission. The Commission requests that a 5-minute time limit be observed for comments. Please begin your comments by stating and spelling your name and providing your street name and city. Please note that issues raised under Citizen's Comments are informational only and the Commission will not take action at this time.
3. CHANGES OR COMMENTS TO THE AGENDA–
4. CONSENT CALENDAR - All items under the consent calendar are to be considered routine and will be enacted by one motion. For any discussion of an item on the consent calendar, it will be removed at the request of the Commission and made a part of the regular agenda.
  - Planning Division Fee Amendments: Consideration of revisions to the Planning Division fees as contained in City of Visalia Fee Resolution No. 2017-38.
5. PUBLIC HEARING – Andy Chamberlain
  - Variance No. 2018-01: A request by Central Valley Sweeping to exceed the 25% office area limit in the Industrial Zone, allowing a 36% office area totaling approximately 1,925 sq. ft. of office in a 5,438 sq. ft. building, in the Industrial (I) Zone. The site is located at 10313 W. Legacy Avenue. (APN: 073-220-003).The project is Categorical Exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) pursuant to CEQA Guidelines Section 15305, Categorical Exemption No. 2018-01
6. PUBLIC HEARING – Paul Scheibel
  - a. Lowery West Tentative Subdivision Map TSM 5564: A request to subdivide 48 acres into 218 lots for residential units, including a 17.5-acre portion proposed as a Planned Residential Development (PRD) with 94 residential lots with gated access and private streets. The project site is zoned R-1-5 (Single-family Residential, 5,000 sq. ft. minimum lot size), is located near the northeast corner of Riggan Ave. and Akers St. (APNs 077-060-006 and -028) The project has been found to be consistent with Mitigated Negative Declaration No. 2016-63.
  - b. Conditional Use Permit CUP 2017-32: A request for a Planned Residential Development (PRD) on a 17.5-acre portion of a proposed 48-acre, 218-unit residential subdivision. The PRD proposes to develop 94 residential lots with gated access and private streets, modifications to the minimum standards of the R-1-5 Zoned District, including lots that are smaller than 5,000 square feet less than 50 feet in width, and reduced yard setbacks. The site is zoned R-1-5 (Single-family Residential, 5,000 sq. ft. minimum lot size), located near on the northeast corner of Riggan Ave. and Akers St. (APNs 077-060-006 and -028) The project has been found

to be consistent with Mitigated Negative Declaration No. 2016-63.

7. REGULAR HEARING-Paul Scheibel
  - 2017 Annual Housing Element Progress Report
8. DIRECTOR'S REPORT/ PLANNING COMMISSION DISCUSSION-

The Planning Commission meeting may end no later than 11:00 P.M. Any unfinished business may be continued to a future date and time to be determined by the Commission at this meeting. The Planning Commission routinely visits the project sites listed on the agenda.

For the hearing impaired, if signing is desired, please call (559) 713-4359 twenty-four (24) hours in advance of the scheduled meeting time to request these services. For the visually impaired, if enlarged print or Braille copy is desired, please call (559) 713-4359 for this assistance in advance of the meeting and such services will be provided as soon as possible following the meeting.

Any written materials relating to an item on this agenda submitted to the Planning Commission after distribution of the agenda packet are available for public inspection in the City Office, 315 E. Acequia Visalia, CA 93291, during normal business hours.

#### **APPEAL PROCEDURE**

**THE LAST DAY TO FILE AN APPEAL IS THURSDAY, MARCH 22, 2018 BEFORE 5 PM**

According to the City of Visalia Zoning Ordinance Section 17.02.145 and Subdivision Ordinance Section 16.04.040, an appeal to the City Council may be submitted within ten days following the date of a decision by the Planning Commission. An appeal form with applicable fees shall be filed with the City Clerk at 220 N. Santa Fe, Visalia, CA 93292. The appeal shall specify errors or abuses of discretion by the Planning Commission, or decisions not supported by the evidence in the record. The appeal form can be found on the city's website [www.visalia.city](http://www.visalia.city) or from the City Clerk.

**THE NEXT REGULAR MEETING WILL BE HELD ON MONDAY, MARCH 26, 2018**

# **City of Visalia**



To: Planning Commission

From: Paul Scheibel, AICP, Principal Planner, 713-4369

Date: March 12, 2018

Re: **2017 Annual Housing Element Progress Report**

## **BACKGROUND**

Pursuant to State Housing Law, (Government Code Section 65400), California cities are required to report their progress on implementing their most current Housing Elements. This includes numerical reporting on their incremental success in achieving their by-income category residential development, as mandated by their Regional Housing Needs Allocation (RHNA).

The report is required to be reviewed by the City Council, and delivered to the State Housing and Community Development Department (HCD) by April 1<sup>st</sup>. Failure to prepare and deliver the report on a timely basis incurs a risk to the City of losing future housing grant funding opportunities. The report is use a useful tool for City officials and staff, and for citizens and stakeholder groups interested in the City's housing trends- particularly as they relate to affordable housing.

This report is being provided to the Planning Commission as an informational report only. Consequently, no formal action is required by the Planning Commission.

## **DISCUSSION**

The Annual Housing Element Progress Report (Report) is organized by key statistical and self-analysis sections. The statistical section (Table A through A-3) summarize the number of new residential units built during the calendar year, the number of affordable units built or rehabilitated using City resources [partnership with qualifying entities (such as Habitat for Humanity) and funding through one or more of the City's housing programs], and their incremental effect on meeting the City's total RHNA obligations.

Table B combines the new housing (and rehabilitated) housing units added to the residential inventory during the calendar year with the City's RHNA. The State HCD pays particular attention to this Table. The State merges the City's data with that received from all reporting cities and counties as a method of gauging the effectiveness of housing policies on balancing housing costs with housing needs for all income and special needs categories.

Table C is a self-analysis tool that allows the City to review its success during the calendar year in implementing the housing programs and accomplishing the goals contained in the Housing Element Update. The City reviews the Housing Element goals and policies in the context of the available resources and established time

lines. Through this process, the City is able to re-evaluate individual policies and programs in the context of available resources and priorities.

The General Comments section of the report allows for narratives to further clarify the more quantitative sections of the report. For example, the narrative explaining any actions affecting properties in the RHNA Land Inventory is contained in the General Comments section. Additionally, the methodology for equating housing unit price with affordability is explained in the General Comments section.

## **SUMMARY**

### **New Residential Housing Units-**

During Calendar Year 2017, the City issued permits for 553 residential units. 70 of these were multi-family units. This compares with CY 2016, during which 705 residential units were constructed, with 130 being multi-family units.

All of the 70 multi-family units are classified as affordable to Low Income categories, based on the project's underlying zone density. None of the units are deed restricted or benefit from participation in the City's affordable housing incentives and concessions provisions (Zoning Ordinance Section 17.32.170, et.seq.).

Two single-family units (one duplex) are classified as affordable to Low Income categories, based on total valuation of the permit and number of bedrooms. Twenty-nine units are classified as affordable to Moderate Income categories, the remainder 403 are classified as Above-moderate income houses.

The City provided financial assistance for five affordable units in CY 2017. Four were funds toward exterior repairs or replacement of mobile homes belonging to qualifying Senior homeowners. One unit was funded through a land sale to Habitat for Humanity to complete a single-family residence which was completed in 2017. This property has a twenty (20) year Affordability Covenant.

### **Regional Housing Needs Allocation (RHNA) Compliance-**

There were a total of seven discretionary actions affecting the City's Regional Housing Needs Allocation (RHNA) obligations. Two projects reduced the RHNA unit count by a total of 47 units (Low Income category). However five projects were entitled on R-M-2 Zoned properties that were not listed on the RHNA Inventory List for a total gain of 136 units (Low Income Category). The total net gain is 89 units (Low Income category)

A re-zone of 15.6 acres zoned R-M-3, and included in the RHNA Land Inventory for 361 units of Very Low (VL) and Extremely Low Income (ELI), to R-M-2 and recalculated for 188 units of Low Income category was completed in CY 2017. Both the VL and ELI categories were in surplus by 723 units (HE Update Table 48-A). Consequently, the RHNA remains in compliance with the Housing Element and State law.

## Housing Element Implementation-

The key Program accomplishment for CY 2017 was adoption of the General Plan Housing Element Amendment (GPA) policies and Zoning Text Amendments (ZTA) to implement the Housing Element Update. In addition, the City entitled an eight-unit residential mixed-use project in the Downtown Mixed Use Zone District.

## **ATTACHMENT**

Draft Annual Housing Element Progress Report for Calendar Year 2017

# ANNUAL ELEMENT PROGRESS REPORT

## *Housing Element Implementation*

(CCR Title 25 §6202.)

Jurisdiction VISALIA  
Reporting Period 01/01/2017 - 12/31/2017

Pursuant to GC 65400 local governments must provide by April 1 of each year the annual report for the previous calendar year to the legislative body, the Office of Planning and Research (OPR), and the Department of Housing and Community Development (HCD). By checking the "Final" button and clicking the "Submit" button, you have submitted the housing portion of your annual report to HCD only. Once finalized, the report will no longer be available for editing.

The report must be printed and submitted along with your general plan report directly to OPR at the address listed below:

Governor's Office of Planning and Research  
P.O. Box 3044  
Sacramento, CA 95812-3044

# ANNUAL ELEMENT PROGRESS REPORT

## Housing Element Implementation

(CCR Title 25 §6202.)

Jurisdiction: VISALIA  
 Reporting Period: 01/01/2017 - 12/31/2017

Table A

**Annual Building Activity Report Summary - New Construction  
 Very Low-, Low-, and Mixed-Income Multifamily Projects**

1	2	3	4				5	5a	6		7	8
			Housing Development Information						Housing with Financial Assistance and/or Deed Restrictions			
Project Identifier (may be APN No., project name or address)	Unit Category	Tenure R=Renter O=Owner	Affordability by Household Incomes				Total Units per Project	Est. # Infill Units*	Assistance Programs for Each Development	Deed Restricted Units		
			Very Low-Income	Low-Income	Moderate-Income	Above Moderate-Income			See Instructions	See Instructions		
917 Fulgham St.	SF	Owner	1	0	0	0	1	0			Note below the number of units determined to be affordable without financial or deed restrictions and attach an explanation how the jurisdiction determined the units were affordable. Refer to instructions.	
919 S. Fulgham St.	SF	Owner	1	0	0	0	1	0			3br total valuation \$68,400, affordable for Family of 4 very low income.	
417 E. Harter Ct.	SU	Owner	0	1	0	0	1	0			3br total valuation \$67,900, affordable to VL income 4 person HH.	
4710 W. Kaweah	SF	Owner	0	1	0	0	1	0			Second dwelling unit \$80,000 1 br, affordable for Low income 2-person HH.	
1245 N. Woodland St	5+	Renter	0	8	0	0	8	0			4br \$161,655, affordable for 5 person HH, Low income market rate 8 unit multi-family development 16 br total. Low income affordability based on zoning and development density.	

3420 S. Villa St.	2 to 4	Renter	0	2	0	0	0	0	2	0		Duplex, 4 br total, affordable to L income HH based on zoning density.
912 N. Woodland St.	5+	Renter	0	8	0	0	0	0	8	0		8 unit multi-family affordable to Low income HH based on zoning density
916 N. Woodland St.	5+	Renter	0	8	0	0	0	0	8	0		8 unit multi-family affordable to Low income HH based on zoning density
920 N. Woodland St.	5+	Renter	0	8	0	0	0	0	8	0		8 unit multi-family affordable to Low income HH based on zoning density
3322 S. Villa	2 to 4	Renter	0	2	0	0	0	0	2	0		duplex affordable to Low income HH based on zoning density
3326 S. Villa St.	2 to 4	Renter	0	2	0	0	0	0	2	0		duplex affordable to Low income HH based on zoning density
3312 S. Villa St.	2 to 4	Renter	0	2	0	0	0	0	2	0		duplex affordable to Low income HH based on zoning density
3316 S. Villa St.	2 to 4	Renter	0	2	0	0	0	0	2	0		duplex affordable to Low income HH based on zoning density
3302 S. Villa St.	2 to 4	Renter	0	2	0	0	0	0	2	0		duplex affordable to Low income HH based on zoning density
3204 S. Villa St	2 to 4	Renter	0	2	0	0	0	0	2	0		duplex affordable to Low income HH based on zoning density
3200 S. Villa St.	2 to 4	Renter	0	2	0	0	0	0	2	0		duplex affordable to Low income HH based on zoning density
3214 S. Villa St.	2 to 4	Renter	0	2	0	0	0	0	2	0		duplex affordable to Low income HH based on zoning density.
3210 S. Villa St.	2 to 4	Renter	0	2	0	0	0	0	2	0		duplex affordable to Low income HH based on zoning density
3224 S. Villa St.	2 to 4	Renter	0	2	0	0	0	0	2	0		duplex affordable to Low income HH based on zoning density
3220 S. Villa st.	2 to 4	Renter	0	2	0	0	0	0	2	0		duplex affordable to Low income HH based on zoning density
3234 S. Villa St.	2 to 4	Renter	0	2	0	0	0	0	2	0		duplex affordable to Low income HH based on zoning density



3230 S. Villa St.	2 to 4	Renter	0	2	0	0	0	2	0	duplex affordable to Low income HH based on zoning density
3244 S. Villa St.	2 to 4	Renter	0	2	0	0	0	2	0	duplex affordable to Low income HH based on Zoning density
3240 S. Villa St.	2 to 4	Renter	0	2	0	0	0	2	0	duplex affordable to Low income HH based on zoning density
3306 S. Villa St.	2 to 4	Renter	0	2	0	0	0	2	0	duplex affordable to Low income HH based on zoning density
220 S. Grand St	2 to 4	Renter	0	2	0	0	0	2	0	duplex affordable to Low income HH based on zoning density
4435 E. Acequia	2 to 4	Renter	0	2	0	0	0	2	0	duplex affordable to Low income HH based on zoning density.
<b>(9) Total of Moderate and Above Moderate from Table A3</b>										
(10) Total by Income Table A/A3			2	72	29	403				
<b>(11) Total Extremely Low-Income Units*</b>			0							

# ANNUAL ELEMENT PROGRESS REPORT Housing Element Implementation

(CCR Title 25 §6202 )

Jurisdiction VISALIA  
Reporting Period 01/01/2017 - 12/31/2017

**Table A2  
Annual Building Activity Report Summary - Units Rehabilitated, Preserved and Acquired pursuant to GC Section 65583.1(c)(1)**

Please note: Units may only be credited to the table below when a jurisdiction has included a program it its housing element to rehabilitate, preserve or acquire units to accommodate a portion of its RHNA which meet the specific criteria as outlined in GC Section 65583.1(c)(1)

Activity Type	Affordability by Household Incomes				(4) The Description should adequately document how each unit complies with subsection (c)(7) of Government Code Section 65583.1
	Extremely Low-Income*	Very Low-Income	Low-Income	TOTAL UNITS	
(1) Rehabilitation Activity	0	4	0	4	Senior's mobile home repair program. Four units 1415 N. Tipton St. Assistanc
(2) Preservation of Units At-Risk	0	0	0	0	
(3) Acquisition of Units	0	1	0	1	Land sale to Habitat for Humanity for one SFR, completed in 2017. Deed restr
(5) Total Units by Income	0	5	0	5	

\* Note: This field is voluntary

# ANNUAL ELEMENT PROGRESS REPORT

## *Housing Element Implementation*

(CCR Title 25 §6202.)

Jurisdiction VISALIA  
 Reporting Period 01/01/2017 - 12/31/2017

**Table A3**  
**Annual building Activity Report Summary for Above Moderate-Income Units**  
 (not including those units reported on Table A)

	1. Single Family	2. 2 - 4 Units	3. 5+ Units	4. Second Unit	5. Mobile Homes	6. Total	7. Number of infill units*
No. of Units Permitted for <b>Moderate</b>	29	0	0	0	0	29	0
No. of Units Permitted for <b>Above Moderate</b>	403	0	0	0	0	403	0

\* Note: This field is voluntary

# ANNUAL ELEMENT PROGRESS REPORT

## Housing Element Implementation

(CCR Title 25 §6202 )

Jurisdiction VISALIA  
 Reporting Period 01/01/2017 - 12/31/2017

**Table B**  
**Regional Housing Needs Allocation Progress**  
 Permitted Units Issued by Affordability

Enter Calendar Year starting with the first year of the RHNA allocation period. See Example.	Income Level	RHNA Allocation by Income Level	Year	Year	Year	Year	Year	Year	Year	Year	Year	Year	Year	Total Units to Date (all years)	Total Remaining RHNA by Income Level
			1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9				
Very Low	Deed	2616	9	36	2	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	89	2527
	Restricted Non-		0	42	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0		
	Restricted Deed		106	0	72	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0		
Low	Deed	1931	0	118	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	296	1635
	Restricted Non-		132	279	29	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0		
	Restricted Deed		367	246	403	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0		
Moderate		1802												440	1362
Above Moderate		3672												1016	2656
Total RHNA by COG.		10021													
Enter allocation number:			614	721	506	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1841	8180
Total Units															
Remaining Need for RHNA Period															

Note: units serving extremely low-income households are included in the very low-income permitted units totals.

# ANNUAL ELEMENT PROGRESS REPORT

## Housing Element Implementation

(CCR Title 25 §6202 )

Jurisdiction VISALIA  
 Reporting Period 01/01/2017 - 12/31/2017

**Table C**  
**Program Implementation Status**

Program Description (By Housing Element Program Names)	Objective	Timeframe in H.E.	Status of Program Implementation
HE Program 9.10 Zoning Text Amendments	Process all identified Zoning Text Amendments (ZTA) to implement the HE Update	Within one year of adoption of the HE Update	<p><b>Housing Programs Progress Report - Government Code Section 65583.</b>                      Describe progress of all programs including local efforts to remove governmental constraints to the maintenance, improvement, and development of housing as identified in the housing element.</p> <p>Ordinance 2017-13 was introduced for first reading on November 20, 2017, and adopted by second reading on December 18, 2017. The Ordinance implements State mandates and local initiatives pertaining to housing policy, as follows:                      State Mandates                      Revise definition of "Affordable Housing"                      Revise definition of "Transitional Housing"                      Revise permitting process by zone district for the following housing classifications- Farmworker or Employee Housing, Transitional housing, Supportive housing.                      Codify exemptions from zoning standards to facilitate reasonable accommodation.                      City-initiated Code revisions                      Increase unit threshold for multi-family projects permitted by right                      Revise mobile home park development standards                      Codify the in-fill incentive program                      These Code revisions also implement each individual HE Program related to the subject Code action.</p>

<p>HE Program 9.8 Disadvantaged Unincorporated Communities (DUC)</p>	<p>Comply with SB 244 to establish a residents survey and outreach program in the K Road County Island.</p>	<p>Within one year of adoption of HE Update</p>	<p>Survey done April 2017. Inconclusive interests but generally unfavorable. Full annexation made a LAFCO condition of approval for Annexation 2017-01. Anticipate renewed outreach and annexation filing by February 2019.</p>
<p>HE Program 6.5 Rehabilitation and Adaptive Reuse</p>	<p>Assist five units per year</p>	<p>Ongoing</p>	<p>CUP 2017-26 Downtown commercial building with former hotel on second floor at 115 N. Court St. approved as a market rate rental project June 17, 2017.</p>
<p>HE Program 6.1 Housing Rehabilitation Program</p>	<p>preserve existing affordable housing stock by providing low income loans for qualifying income homeowners. Assist 25 homeowners over life of program</p>	<p>Ongoing</p>	<p>Four forgivable loans made to qualified seniors to make life safety repairs to their mobile homes during CY 2017.</p>

# ANNUAL ELEMENT PROGRESS REPORT

## Housing Element Implementation

(CCR Title 25 §6202 )

<b>Jurisdiction</b>	VISALIA
<b>Reporting Period</b>	01/01/2017 - 12/31/2017

**General Comments:**

Regional Housing Needs Allocation (RHNA) Land Inventory List performance and compliance update. Pursuant to Housing Element Program 9.4 (Monitor the RHNA Land Inventory), the following information pertaining to development actions affecting properties included in the RHNA Land Inventory (Housing Element Table B-1):

RHNA Units Lost: During CY 2017, the City entitled two projects on RHNA designated property

1. CUP 2017-08 200 unit apartment complex- RHNA units anticipated- 203 (Low Income Affordability Category); RHNA units actual - 200
2. CUP 2017-02/TSM 5558 (small lot subdivision)- RHNA units anticipated- 95 (Low Income Affordability Category); RHNA units actual- 51.

Net Loss- 47 units

RHNA Units Gained: During CY 2017, the City entitled five projects on M-R-2 Zoned property (Multi-family residential 10/15 units per acre) that are not on the RHNA Inventory List. The developments would otherwise qualify for credits as Low Income Affordability Category projects, totaling 136 units (Low Income Category)

Conclusion: During CY 2017, there was no net loss of RHNA designated units by income category.

New Housing Units Affordability Methodology: Determination of the affordability factor of new housing for permits issued in CY 2017 were calculated as follows:

- 1- Identify median income for 4-person household in Tulare County, based on Annual State Report.
- 2- Calculate mortgage payment ability using Chase Affordability Calculator. Standard data entry assumptions as follows: 4-person income divided by 12 = monthly income; Monthly expenses 10% of income; Down payment 5%; Interest rate 4.5%; Property taxes and Insurance 4% of house cost.
- 3- Assume house cost as declared assessed total valuation on permit record.
- 4- Compare house cost with mortgage qualification total. Where unit exceeds 3 bedrooms, use State formula for increased household size (generally one member per additional bedrooms over 3).